CARMA

Non-formal learning for student motivation

Early School Leaving – Statistics, Policies and Good Practices in Collaborative Learning

WP2-1 Country specific report mapping data across all 7 partner countries

Coordinator of WP2: University of Murcia (Spain)

Project no 562261-EPP-1-2015-1-IT-EPPKA3-PI-FORWARD

En

Co-funded by the Erasmus+ Programme of the European Union

www.carma-project.eu

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication [communication] reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

CARMA

RMA and other non formal learning methods for student motivation

WP2 Lead Partner: University of Murcia (Spain)

Paz Prendes-Espinosa Linda Castañeda Isabel Gutiérrez M.Mar Sánchez-Vera



WP2. Research Study and Needs Analysis

The CARMA project has been designed in the form of 8 Work Packages and 4 main project phases which have been structured to improve and assess project implementation and to give to partners milestones and performance indicators to ensure good overall management of the project and each WP from start to finish.

This report summarizes the task 1 developed in the **Phase 1 Preparation**: Desk based quantitative and qualitative research.

Task 1: Desk based quantitative and qualitative research, carried out by all partners in all 7 countries inquiring statistics and policies regards ESL, collection of good practices in collaborative learning in schools. The research will also include a part on the existing national frameworks for the assessment of teacher competences, benchmarks used and applied standards.





Content

Figures	8
Tables	8
Desk Research	11
Introduction	12
ESL Statistics	15
General Data	15
Gender	19
Foreign Born	20
Ethnic Minorities	20
Degree of Urbanisation	20
Consequences	21
Data by country	
Austria	22
Belgium	22
France	25
Italy	26
Portugal	27
Spain	28
Turkey	30
Policies: national actions and national projects regarding ESL	
General Data	31
Data by country	
Austria	33
National Action:	
National project:	34
Belgium	34







National Action:	
National project:	
France	
National action:	
National project:	
Italy	
National action:	
National projects:	
Portugal	41
National action:	41
National project:	41
Spain	42
National action:	42
National project:	43
Turkey:	43
National action:	43
National project:	
Evaluation of skills of Secondary teachers	47
Evaluation of skills of Secondary teachers	
-	47
General Data	47 47
General Data	47 47 48
General Data Data by country	47 47 48 48
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria	
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria Belgium	
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria Belgium France	
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria Belgium France Compétences communes à to us Les professeurs et personnels d'éducation	
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria Belgium France Compétences communes à to us Les professeurs et personnels d'éducation Italy	47 48 48 48 49 51 51 52 52
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria Belgium France Compétences communes à to us Les professeurs et personnels d'éducation Italy Valorizza Project:	47 47 48 48 49 51 51 51 52 52 52
General Data	47 48 48 48 49 51 51 52 52 52 53 53
General Data	47 48 48 48 49 51 51 52 52 52 53 53 54
General Data	47 48 48 48 49 51 52 52 52 52 53 53 54
General Data Data by country Austria TALIS in Austria Belgium France Compétences communes à to us Les professeurs et personnels d'éducation Italy Valorizza Project: Portugal Continuous training Specialised Training Spain	47 48 48 48 49 51 51 52 52 53 53 53 54 54





Generic Teacher Competencies.	55
Intel Teach - Advanced Online" programme	
Good Practices in Collaborative Learning	
COLLECTION OF PRACTICES BY EVERY PARTNER	59
ANALYSIS OF PRACTICES	60
1. ABOUT MAIN GOALS	60
2. CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS.	62
3. DESCRIPTION	63
4. FINAL RESULTS	66
5. WHY ARE THEY RELEVANT?	67
Collected Cases	69
CASE 1	
CASE 2	
CASE 3	71
CASE 4	73
CASE 5	
CASE 6	
CASE 7	
CASE 8	
CASE 9	
CASE 10	
CASE 11	
CASE 11	
Desk Research Conclusions	
References	86

Grupo de Investigación de Tecnología Educativa Universidad de Murcia





Figures

Figure 1. Online Forms to Collect Information. Screenshots						
Figure 2. Early leavers from education and training 2015 by country (Eurostat, 2016).15						
Figure 3. Early leavers from education and training in 2015, countries in the CA	RMA's					
partnership. (Eurostat, 2016).	16					
Figure 4. Evolution of the total ESL percentage by country (1995, 2000, 2005,	, 2010,					
2015). Eurostat, 2016	17					
Figure 5. Evolution of the total ESL percentage in the CARMA's partnership cou	untries,					
by country (1995, 2000, 2005, 2010, 2015)	18					
Figure 6. 2015 ESL rate by country. (Eurostat, 2016).	19					
Figure 7. ESL by Gender. CARMA Partnership Countries.	20					
Figure 8. Early leavers from education and training by degree of urbanisation (update					
10th March 2016, Eurostat).	21					
Figure 9. ESL in Belgium. Rates for 2015.	Source					
http://statbel.fgov.be/nl/statistieken/cijfers/arbeid_leven/opleiding/vroegtijdig/23						
Figure 10. Early leavers in Belgium by place of bird.	24					
Figure 11. Form on line to collect Good Collaborative Practices (on Google Drive) 59					
Figure 12. Good practices collected by every partner60						

Tables

Table 1. Specific Data Included in the Report by Country.	13
Table 2. OKI or Education Underprivileged-Indicator	24
Table 3. Sample of of collected national actions and national projects regarding ESL	31
Table 4. Policies on ESL: National Projects and National Actions included in this rep	ort,
by Country	33
Table 5. Secondary Teachers' Skills Evaluation Programmes included on this Repor	t by
Country	48



Grupo de Investigación de Tecnología Educativa Universidad de Murcia







Desk Research

TASK 1:

Statistics and policies regards ESL, existing national frameworks for the assessment of teacher competences, benchmarks used and applied standards and collection of good practices in collaborative learning in schools.





Introduction

The first part of this report summarises the Desk Research regarding the factors that would affect or condition the associated interventions and developments delivered on this project.

Firstly, this analysis explores the principal facts and figures of the European Union -and the partnership countries- around the Early School Leaving (from here on ESL).

For this purpose, this report assumes the definition of the Eurostat referred to Early leaver from education and training, also known (because of a previously name) **early school leaver**, and understand that this relates to a person aged 18 to 24 who has completed at most lower Secondary Education (International Standard Classification of Education ISCED 2011) and is not involved in further educational or training programme.

Regarding ESL, this report will show the main numbers (focused in the seven countries of the partnership (Portugal, Spain, France, Italy, Austria, Belgium and Turkey), as well as the influence of different kind of factors in this phenomenon.

Secondly, this report is including the main policies to mitigate the ESL implemented by the governments within the seven partnership countries.

Understanding that the teacher training and professional competence as a crucial factor of the strong improvement of the ESL facts, in the third part, this report includes the primary mechanisms used by the governments to evaluate the secondary school teachers' skills.

Finally, in this report we have detailed some of the best practices found in the partnership countries, regarding ESL, avoiding and prevention.

In order to collect the data included in this report, each project partner team has chosen the national information that they considered as most relevant, and they all have used three online forms based in Google Drive, to put all this information in common.





Figure 1. Online Forms to Collect Information. Screenshots.

As general view, the data included on this report are:

Country	ESL	Poli	Policies Teacher's Skills Good			
	Statistics	National Actions	National Projects	Evaluation Programmes	Practices	
Austria	Yes	2	2	1	1	
Belgium	Yes	3	5	1	1	
France	Yes	1	1	1	1	
Italy	Yes	3	5	1	3	
Portugal	Yes	1	1	2	1	
Spain	Yes	1	2	2	3	
Turkey	Yes	1	3	2	2	

Table 1. Specific Data Included in the Report by Country.





ESL Statistics

General Data

Following the Eurostat's data, early school leaving in Europe is far away from equilibrated in the entire union. In average, data say than 11% of young people (aged 18–24) in the EU-28 (the same in EU-27 and just 11.6% in the Euro-area) were early leavers from education and training in 2015, in other words they have "completed at most a lower secondary education and not being in further education or training" (Eurostat, 2016).



Figure 2. Early leavers from education and training 2015 by country (Eurostat, 2016).

From those data the differences among regions are astonishing, ignoring the 2.8 from Croatia (the Eurostat's affirm this data is not very reliable), the differences are too wide





inside the EU. The statistics reveal several differences among countries, from the small data from Lithuania (5.5%), or Cyprus and Poland (with a 5.3% each), Switzerland (5.1%) and Slovenia (5.0%), until the 18.8% from Iceland, the 19.1% of Romania, the 19.9% of Malta, the 20% from Spain or the 36.4% from Turkey. The differences are wide open.

When we see the reality of CARMA's partnership, the data show very well the extreme points, as well as some countries that already have got the "desirable" data.



Figure 3. Early leavers from education and training in 2015, countries in the CARMA's partnership. (Eurostat, 2016).

Nevertheless, taking into account the historical evolution in the Union, there is evidence related to the improvement of the situation. General data reveal than the average on ESL for the EU-28 has improved in the last ten years, from the 15.7% in 2005, passing across 13.9% in 2010 until the 11% of 2015, for a total fall of 4.7 percentage points. Moreover, this improvement has been evident in all the EU countries as could be seen in the following graph:







Grupo de Investigación de

Iniversidad de Murcia

Tecnología Educativa

₫

Belgium Bulgaria Czech Republic Denmark Germany Estonia Ireland Greece Spain
 France Croatia Italy Cyprus Latvia Lithuania Luxembourg Hungary Malta
 Netherlands Austria Poland Portugal Romania Slovenia Slovakia Finland Sweden
 United Kingdom Iceland Norway Switzerland Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, the
 Turkey Unavailable data is ignored

Figure 4. Evolution of the total ESL percentage by country (1995, 2000, 2005, 2010, 2015). Eurostat, 2016.

In this trend of improving, it is outstanding the rate of decreasing in this indicator of some countries, as Spain (with a decreasing rate of 11% since 2005), Cyprus (12.9%) and Portugal (24.6%).

The only exception to this improving trend are the case of Norway (among the nonmember countries) that has experimented an increase of 5.6 percentage points in the ESL (4.6% in 2005 to 10.2% in 2015), and Slovakia and Slovenia, where the ESL has also raised but in tiny proportion (0.1 and 0.6 points respectively).

These data are more evident –if there- in the visualisation that includes only the CARMA partnership countries.



.





Grupo de Investigación de

Iniversidad de Murcia

Tecnología Educativa

Figure 5. Evolution of the total ESL percentage in the CARMA's partnership countries, by country (1995, 2000, 2005, 2010, 2015).

As part of the Europe 2020 strategy, apart from the EU target of a 10% of ESL, most of the EU Member States have adopted national targets for this indicator (always related to the specific conditions of each country and its predictable development). By the moment, the situation of each one is diverse. Nonetheless it is very significant that, in the same time as other countries are almost on their target point (Belgium, Czech Republic, Germany, France, Netherlands or Slovenia), the gap between the 2015 rate for early leavers from education and training and the national target for 2020 was particularly pronounced in Spain (5 point, from the 20% of 2015 to the 11% on the target), Romania (7.8 percentage points of difference between the 19.1% of 2015 and the 11.3 of the target) and Malta (9.8 percentage points of difference between the 19.8% of 2015 and the 10% in the target).

The first evidence from the data we got are the differences related to the geographic situation. If we see the European map that shows the levels of ESL by country, it is very obvious the differences among countries and zones with some palpable trends differentiated by South, Center and North of Europe, with just a few exceptions.

Grupo de Investigación de Tecnología Educativa





Figure 6. 2015 ESL rate by country. (Eurostat, 2016).

Gender

UNIVERSIDAD DE

In this general perspective, it is remarkable, that the proportion of early leavers from education and training in 2015 in the EU-28 was 2.9 percentage points higher for young men (12.4 %) than for young women (9.5 %).

This general trend is applicable to almost every country in Europe with two exceptional tendencies, some countries where the differences between women and men are less than a 0.9 percentage points, as Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Germany, Hungary, Slovakia and Switzerland, and but the candidates countries Macedonia and Turkey, where the inequality is remarked but in a diverse direction, the proportion of ESL is higher for young women than for men (2.9 and 2.6 percentage points, respectively). Moreover, those data are evident as well in the case of the CARMA's partnership countries.



🗖 Males 🔳 Females

Figure 7. ESL by Gender. CARMA Partnership Countries.

Foreign Born

The EU Remarks as well that "young foreign-born residents have a higher tendency to abandon formal education prematurely". In the EU, the rate of early leavers among migrants in 2013 was more than twice as high as for natives (22.6 % compared with 11 %). Language difficulties, leading to underachievement and lack of motivation, the lower socioeconomic status of foreign-born residents are possible reasons.

Ethnic Minorities

In some countries around Europe, the proportion of students dropping out early, or even not attending school at all, is especially high among ethnic minorities, such as Roma. Following the EU reports, In 2011 more than 10 % of Roma children were not attending compulsory education in Romania, Bulgaria, France and Italy. In Greece, this rate reached the 35 %.

Degree of Urbanisation

Following the Eurostat's data, if we analyse the proportion of early leavers from education and training according to the level of urbanization, with regions classified as cities, towns and suburbs, or rural areas (Eurostat, 2016), there are differences difference between the countryside and cities, but always very relative to the country.









(⁷) Low reliability. Source: Eurostat (online data code: edat_lfse_30)

Figure 8. Early leavers from education and training by degree of urbanisation (update 10th March 2016, Eurostat).

In this figure we could see that, in the vast majority of Europe, the differences between cities and rural areas are around 5 percentage points, but the cases of Hungary and Greece that are around 10 percentage points of difference, and the cases of Romania, Bulgaria, Estonia and Iceland, where the differences are beyond the 10 percentage points.

In the end, on the case of this specific indicator, is relevant to take into account that the results are related, not only with this but, with these data geolocated.

Consequences

As the Eurostat's report confirms, in 2015, 12.0 % of 18 to 24-year-old were in the NEET status. NEET is the indicator that monitoring young people neither in employment nor education and training. This situation is putting them at risk of being excluded from the





labour market and becoming dependent. As Eurostat declare: "Low educational attainment is one of the key determinants of young people entering the NEET category".

Data by country

Austria

If we consider an age-span between 15-25 years old, Austria has 7.3% of ESL rate. Even when this data is lower than the target for Europe 2020 Strategy (10%), it means that almost 100.000 persons that leave the school earlier in this country.

As in most of the European countries, boys tend to drop out of school earlier than girls (7.8% males, versus 6.8% females), and there are more secondary students included in the ESL-rate than any other schools. Therefore, type of school, geography and gender, are considered as indicators that play an insignificant role.

The EU Education Indicators for 2015 regarding School Dropout bring praise and blame for Austria. On one hand, the school dropout rate lies below the EU average, and vocational education is excellent regarding meeting the requests of the labour market, but the high- school drop-out rate is too high.

Belgium

Eurostat figures for 2012 show that Belgium is at or around the EU average for early school leaving, with a 10.1%. Nevertheless, the target for the Europe Strategy 202 of Belgium was fixed at 9% so, there still is more to do.

The table below shows the huge differences between the three regions in Belgium, next to gender, differences, this being an European factor. There is also a difference between the provinces and regional capitals.







Belgium	2015
Total	10,1%
Male	11,6%
Female	8,6%
Brussels capital region	2015
Total	15,8%
Male	16,9%
Female	14,8%
Flemish region	2015
Total	7,2%
Male	8,6%
Female	5,8%
Walloon Region	2015
Total	13,1%
Male	15,0%
Female	11,1%

Figure 9. ESL in Belgium. Rates for 2015. Source

http://statbel.fgov.be/nl/statistieken/cijfers/arbeid_leven/opleiding/vroegtijdig/

It is already clear that other variables besides gender are affecting the rates of early school leaving. The fact that there are vast differences between provinces and regional capitals can be attributed to some factors of which being underprivileged plays a huge part.

The OKI or Education Underprivileged-Indicator is based on the following characteristics:

- Language, when a pupil does not speak Dutch at home or doesn't speak it with more than one family member (min. 3 person household)
- Educational level of the mother, max. Lower secondary level
- Neighbourhood, based on the amount of 15-years old with minimum two years behind at school
- Receiving school allowance

Depending on how many indicators relate to the pupil, he is registered as OKI 1, OKI 2, OKI 3 and 4.





As there are few differences between OKI 3 and 4, these categories are taken together. It is evident that ESL increases by category.

	2	2009-2010		2010-2011		2011-2012			2012-2013			
	Aantal VSV	% VSV	Aandeel VSV	Aantal VSV	% VSV	Aandeel VSV	Aantal VSV	% VSV	Aandeel VSV	Aantal VSV	% VSV	Aandeel VSV
OKI 0	1.725	5,2%	18,0%	1.796	5,3%	19,4%	1.558	4,7%	18,5%	1.403	4,3%	17,3%
OKI 1	2.335	10,9%	24,4%	2.250	10,8%	24,3%	1.991	10,2%	23,6%	1.886	9,9%	23,3%
OKI 2	1.860	20,2%	19,4%	1.756	19,7%	19,0%	1.609	19,3%	19,1%	1.546	18,5%	19,1%
OKI 3,4	1.570	28,5%	16,4%	1.434	26,9%	15,5%	1.360	26,0%	16,1%	1.388	25,1%	17,1%
Niet beschikbaar	2.074	46,3%	21,7%	2.010	47,9%	21,7%	1.919	47,8%	22,7%	1.874	49,2%	23,1%
Totaal	9.564	12,9%	100,0%	9.246	12,7%	100,0%	8.437	12,0%	100,0%	8.097	11,7%	100,0%

Table 2. OKI or Education Underprivileged-Indicator.

Socio-economic features are the predictors of ESL as they are connected to equal opportunities in education. Also, the ethnic background of the students plays an important role, but research demonstrates that the effect of ethnicity on ESL can be explained by the often unfavourable socio-economic background. Gender plays an important part; boys have a bigger chance of ESL than girls and the more years they have to start over again at school the higher the risk on ESL. The same counts for changing school or level of secondary.



Figure 10. Early leavers in Belgium by place of bird.

Next to some push-factors like boredom, wrong vocation, there are also some pull factors that lead students to ESL, e.g. the (alleged) attraction of the labour market.





France

Following Eurostat (2016), in 2015 the ESL rate in France is 9.3%, 0.2 percentage points lower than the target for France in the European Strategy 2020.

Nevertheless, in this case, the trend of the higher impact of ESL of men is evident as in the majority of Europe, due to 10.1% of men are early leavers, but just 8.5% of females are.

Key figures

- 110.000 youngsters leave school every year with no practical qualification (down from 136,000 five years ago)
- 494.000 young people between 18 to 24 years old are unqualified, out of education and risk unemployment (620,000 five years ago)
- €50 million a year is dedicated to fighting early school leaving
- €230,000 is the cost of each unqualified youngster throughout his or her life

The different surveys show that the youngsters that are facing early school leaving situations are quite heterogeneous. Thus, early school leaving impacts in various ways, young people from all socio-professional categories, different family structures and different nationalities.

However, some factors increase highly the risk of early school leaving.

There are globally more boys than girls who are early school leavers (57,4% against 42,6%), and they face this situation earlier also (around 13 years old for the boys, though it is more around 16 for girls). The situations of the girls must not be underestimated since it has been proved that with a similar level of diploma, a girl will have more difficulty to enter the labour market.

Difficulties at school are a factor of early school leaving. Indeed, there is a high correlation between the school results of the pupils when they enter the secondary schools and the proportion of the ones who drop out. A study had shown that 50% of the early school leavers were already facing some difficulties when they entered secondary schools.

75% of the early school leavers repeat a year during their school years and for 25% of them, it happens during the really first years when they have to learn fundamental things (around 6-7 years old). However, it is not the case for all the early school leavers since 1 out of 5 had a good level at the beginning of the secondary school.

Other significant elements are the social category of the father, the diploma of the mother, the standard of revenue of the family, the structure of the household, as well as the course choice (depending on the fact if it is chosen or not). In the total of early school leavers, 34% of them have a father who is a labourer. For 31%, the father is an employee, and less than 10% have a father who is a senior executive or self-employed.





Dropping out is most common in areas of high unemployment such as those in the north around Amiens, in Corsica and overseas departments. Paris, the West and the southern half of France, except for the Mediterranean coast, are among areas least affected.

The high dropout rate not only means personal disaster for hundreds of thousands of youngsters but threatens French competitiveness and makes society pay a high price. The cost of each unqualified young person throughout their life is estimated at €230,000, or nearly €30 billion of debt each year.

Italy

Although the ESL is steadily decreasing in Italy (7.4 percentage points from 2005 to 2015), the phenomenon is still quite common: in 2015, 14.7% of youngsters under 25 left before graduating from high school and without following another training. In the European context, Italy is the 5th country with the highest rates of ESL (behind Spain, Malta, Romania & Turkey).

In June 2010, the national education ministers agreed on a framework for coherent, comprehensive and evidence-based policies to tackle early school leaving. Despite the progress made in a few years, it is still a long way to reduce the number of early school leavers to below 10%, as there are many differences among the Italian regions. Indeed, the South and the Islands still involve 21.4% of early school leavers. Meanwhile, the North and the Centre involve 14.1% early school leavers in average. The highest figures of ESL are in Sicilia (25.8%) and Sardegna (24.7%). Thus, the contraction of the phenomenon is particularly sharp in the southern regions, where the incidence of young people leaving school early dropped by 6.3 percentage points, compared with a decrease of 5.2 percentage points in the regions of the Centre and North. The greatest progress in reducing the phenomenon was achieved by the autonomous province of Bolzano, Puglia and Veneto (decrease of 10 percentage points for the latter).

For most of the cases, girls tend to be less affected by the ESL that the boys. Following Eurostat's data from 2015, the national average of ESL is 14.7% but involves more boys (17.5%) than girls (11.8%). For some regions, one can notice that girls are half less affected by this phenomenon: in 2014 in Veneto, 7% of girls are affected by ESL, while 13,6% of boys are affected. However, it is relevant to remark that in the regions where there are the highest figures of ESL, girls are also really affected – even if it less than boys there: 22,1% in Sicilia and 22,1% in Sardegna.

In general, the decision not to continue one's studies, often an indicator of social hardship concentrated in less developed areas, is common even in most prosperous regions, where high labour demand exerts an undeniable attraction to young people, dissuading them from completing their studies in favour of relatively easy access to employment.

Additionally, ESL is first higher in Vocational schools (Institute professionale) affected with 38% of ESL, then in the Art schools (indirizzi artistici) with 35%, followed by the Technical Institutes (Indirizzi tecnici) with 37%, Human Sciences high schools (licei delle scienze humane) with 24%, Scientific High Schools with 21% and High schools specializing in classical studies (liceo classico) with 18%.





The predominance of ESL among males - economic (above all) and cultural - a few ones understand the importance of acquiring an education level at least equal to compulsory school: those who drop out school do it for economic reasons first of all. However, there are also other facts that play an important part like the relationships developed by the school staff and the youngsters and the language they use with them. Young people can leave school early because they want to help out their family, supporting them with the income they got from their work to bring an off-farm income to their family. Even if it is a tiny temporary income, for some families it is critical.

Plus, the picture of the male "breadwinner" in Italy is still significant (explain the gap between girls and boys in ELS rates): he is the one that has not to study to bring this off-farm income to his family, more than females.

Nevertheless, there are other reasons that could explain the phenomena:

- Socio-economic background of the family
- Irregularities of the school career (cause by a lack of identification, or a specific learning disability such as dyslexia, dysorthography, dyscalculia).
- Youngsters' personal reasons: marginalisation, lack of motivation, low selfesteem
- Difficulties to integrate oneself in a group, or to be victim of bullying
- Lack of a suitable teaching method for everyone: the traditional formal teaching method is not appropriate to all pupils' needs.

Portugal

Portugal was one of the countries that reduced the most its early school leaving rate within the last decade. Data from Eurostat (2016) demonstrates that the ESL rate on education and training has been dropping since ten years ago, and reaching 13.7% in 2015, 24.6 percentage points lower than in 2005, but still higher than the target for Europe Strategy 2020 (10%).

The proportion of females between 18 and 24 years old that had left school without ISCED 3 has been declining, despite the few exceptions in 2006 and 2013, getting its lower share ever (11%). Nonetheless, this data are lower than the trend for males, where the data remark a 16.4% of ESL in 2015.

A report from 2014 launched by the Directorate-General for Education (http://dge.mec.pt/) stresses that children in the 3rd cycle of regular education (children between 13-15 years old) registered higher dropout levels before its conclusion – 15.1 % in 2013/2014. The trend from the last decade is not linear, since from 2004/2005 to 2010/2011 the early dropouts were decreasing year over year, and later, has risen from 2011/2012 to 2013/2014.

Notwithstanding, the high school presents different patterns regarding the matter of retention rates. The students attending general courses in 2013/2014 are more likely to leave the school before finishing the school year while technological courses are less likely to have early leavers (PORDATA, 2015).





In 2014, are estimated 10.401.062 resident people in Portugal, less 56 233 than the previous year and less 172 038 than in 2010 (a year with more registered resident population). The student enrolment in the proportion of the resident population had its peak in 2009 representing 23.05% In 2014; this percentage diminished to 20.02%.

According to PORDATA (2015), the Portuguese population between 25 and 64 years old with at least ISCED 3 education level increased by 16.3% between 2005 and 2014. Data from DGEEC/MEC, DIMAS/RAIDES and PORDATA (2015) show that the school system lost, since 2004/2005, around 91 026 students, which represents 4 pp of the total number of Students of 2013/2014.

According to the same sources, the rise of total number of students in the Portuguese education system until 2008/2009 was due to ISCED 2 and 3. Between 2013 and 2014 there was a severe break in the number of students in all education cycles. The ISCED 2 level was the cycle that lost more students (-4.3%), followed by ISCED 1 (-3.7%) and then ISCED 3 (-3.3%). In 2013/2014, the 53 728 students that have non-Portuguese nationality attending ISCED 2 and 3 levels, represented 4 pp of the total enrolled students. It's in high school that the weight of foreign students is higher – around 5%- of total enrolled students.

The National Statistics Institute (INE - www.ine.pt, 2015) is evident about the enrollees in the ISCED 2 cycle; the growing mass is attending the regular teaching course – a fact that was already expected to this level of education. It can be seen, however, in the last decade, a strong variation in the number of students registered in the Education and Training Courses (CEF – Cursos de Educação e Formação) which had its higher number in 2007/2008 with 45 820 students, thus representing 12 pp of the total number of students in ISCED 2 cycle. Worth to note, the Vocational Courses (Cursos Vocational), which started in 2012/2013 with 243 students, reached the 8 462 enrolled students in 2013/2014 – thirty-five times more. There is also a gradual approximation of the number of students in ISCED 3 between the regular courses and professional courses, represented in 2014 by 55% and 45%, respectively. Also, these two types of courses had a gap in 2004/2005 of around 34%.

Looking at the poverty indexes, it is visible that before the social income transfers, the population with 18 or less years old has the lower risk of poverty -34.6% - but after the transfers happen, this group is identified with a higher rate of poverty risk -24.8% - compared with the other age groups.

Spain

In Spain the rate of early abandonment of education and training, hereafter, educational neglect early- reached 20% in 2015, five percentage points above the level specifically assigned to Spain (15%) 2020.

Following data from 2014 (Consejo Escolar del Estado, 2015), Basque Country (9.4%) and Cantabria (9.7%) are in the top two positions, and achieve the EU target of 10% set for 2020. Meanwhile, the Navarra (11.8%) and the Principality of Asturias (13.6%) have made in 2014 target assigned to Spain for 2020.





A higher incidence of educational neglect in the case of men is observed, which is a fact present in all regions. Figures for Spain indicate in 2015, the existence of a gender gap of 8.2 points (24% for men versus 15.8% for women) and shows that early school leaving is, in our country, one preferably male phenomenon.

Following the data correspondent to 2014, there is a close relationship between the ESL and the mother's level of studies. That 21.9% of young people aged 18 to 24 who prematurely leave education and training is distributed between 12.8% when the mother has basic studies (5.4% and 7.4% primary school lower secondary school), 3.0% when the mother has higher education (post-compulsory secondary school 2.2% and 0.8% tertiary education) and 6.2% when there has educational level of the mother.

Also, early school leaving in the population with foreign nationality, with aged between 18 and 24 years reaches 41.6%, double the rate corresponding to the youth of Spanish nationality, who in 2014 had a value of 21.9 %.

Regarding nationality, early school leaving affects more foreigners than Spaniards. In 2005, the rate of school leavers in the whole of Spain was 31.0%, and for Spaniards 28.6% and 49.3% foreigners. In 2014 these values were 21.9% for all young people, 19.1% for Spanish, compared with 41.6% for foreigners, so that the relative differences between the two groups have increased.

Analysing early school leaving of young people by level of education of the mother, a significant reduction is observed when the mother has higher education. Thus, in 2014, the percentage of youth with early school leavers whose mothers have a higher education is reduced to 3.6%, compared with an average rate of 21.9% for all young people." (PP 484)

In all regions a major shift cohorts younger age to higher levels of training is observed, which in the national count represents, on average, an improvement of 9.4 percentage points; 64.8% of the population aged 25 to 34 have at least minimum studies, compared to 55.4%, which corresponds to the population group aged between 25 and 64 years. This fact indicates a generational improvement of the educational level of the population living in Spain

It is the group of women, in the sector of the younger population (25-34 years), which has contributed to this shift towards higher levels of training. Thus the generational improvement of their educational attainment is 13.3 percentage points -more than double that of the men; 70.8% of women aged 25 to 34 have at least secondary studies (secondary or higher), compared with 57.5% for females aged between 25 and 64 years.

In Spain, the probability that a person aged between 12, to 17 presents risks of poverty or social exclusion is 37.6%, 7.4 points above the figure for the whole European Union 30,02%.





Turkey

In Turkey in 2015; 36.4% of all pupils were early school leavers in contrast to only 11% in the EU-28.

In the case of Turkey, the trend in ESL related to gender is the opposite, women are the most affected by ESL (37.6%), in contrast to males (3.5%) (Eurostat, 2016). Additionally, only 21% of men and only 18% of women of the 30-34 age group get into tertiary education (Delegation of the EU to Turkey).

Early school leaving is a challenge in Turkey. Early school leaving for boys and girls may have similar reasons, such as poverty, but consequences are not necessarily the same. Early and forced marriage is still a problem for girls in Turkey, the result being that the child is probably excluded from education, learning and other opportunities for the rest of her life. Some girls still drop out in the upper grades of primary school due to a combination of poverty and conservative social norms, low expectations and domestic responsibilities.





Policies: national actions and national projects regarding ESL

General Data

In this part, we gather data regarding national measures and national projects related to ESL in each country of the CARMA partnership.

With the term **national actions** this report refers to general policy guidelines promoted by governments in each country; consequently, the term **national projects** refers to concrete proposals (promoted at national, either local level, universities or other institutions, associations, organisations, and so on) focussed on overcoming the ESL.

The sample collected in this section is as follows:

Partner	Country	National action	National project
University of Murcia	Spain	1	2
CESIE	Italy	3	5
Verein Multikulturell	Austria	2	2
Aside Ogretum Kurumlari. DOGA	Turkey	1	3
Innovamais	Portugal	1	1
Pistes Solidaires	France	1	1
UC. Leuven	Belgium	3	5

Table 3. Sample of of collected national actions and national projects regarding ESL.

There is a very updated sample, not in the vain most of the initiatives shown starts in this century (after 2000) and a significant group of projects have been developed in the present decade (2010-2014).

As it will be evident in the following pages, there are some general features that appear as common guidelines about the policies implemented in each country:

Firstly, it is evident that ESL is a concern for all the governments, not in vain, all these countries present a national framework or initiative to overcome ESL. Additionally, there are several initiatives related to specific target groups. Most of the projects described bellow are developed by local institutions /associations /organisations or so, that focus on different local stakeholders (e.g. girls, families), or promote the improvement of ESL across a specific strategy (e.g. job promotion).







Data by country

In this part, we include the data collected by each state related to national actions and projects related with ESL.

Country	Actions	Projects
Austria	 National Action and Strategie for reducing the ESL-rate. BMBF (Bundesministerium für Bildung und Frauen). 2012. Youth Coaching. 2013. Federal Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Consumers Protection. 	 "Unentdeckte Talente" (Undiscovered Talents), it is a project from the Agency for Employment (AMS) in Austria. 2010-2016. "I am I - a part of us". Healthy Austria Funds. 2000.
Belgium	 Actieplan Vroegtijdig Schoolverlaten (2014) (Action Plan Early School Leaving). Flanders, Belgium Wallonian decree (2014. Wallonia Government. Measures to fight against school dropout in place by the Brussels Capital Region Public Service (2015). Brussels Capital Region. 	 "Roma Plus" developed by The training center Foyer in Brussels. The association Odyssée focuses on adolescent school dropouts in Brussels. The association Perspectives from Flémalle has been working 30 years for low-skilled and / or long-term unemployed. Project From chaos to zen. The association School Bridge. The project Tutoring. Association La Teignouse.
France	 "Altogether to beat school dropout". 2014-2016. French Ministry of Education 	Classes et dispositifs relais. 1998. 2002. Ministry of Education.
Italy	 Decree of the Ministry of Education 7th of February 2014 to strengthen tools and projects of schools to decrease the ESL. Autorità Garante per l"Infanzia e l"Adolescenza. 2014. 	 RI.ME.DI RIcerca MEtodologica Didattica contro la dispersione scolastica" project. 2013-2014. Istituto Comprensivo Caronda di Catania. "Le buone prassi contro la dispersione e per l"inclusione". Istituto Istruzione Superiore Artistica Classica Professionale. 2014-2015. "Progetto dispersione". Istituto Comprensivo 2 "S. D'Acquisto. 2013-2014. "Fuoriclasse". Fondazione Agnelli. 2012-2013. "Progetto In-Contro". Save the Children Italia. 2010.







Country	Actions	Projects
Portugal	 Choices Program. Council of Ministers, integrated into the High Commission for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (Alto Comissariado para a Imigração e Diálogo Intercultural) – ACIDI, IP. 	 PMSE - Programa Mais Sucesso Escolar. Stands for Plus Scholar Success Programme
Spain	 Plan para la reducción del abandono educativo temprano - General plan to reduce early school leaving. 2014- 2020 	 PROA Plan. Program for the support, orientation and help against school leaving. Ministry of Education. 2005-2011. "Avoid gipsy ESL". 2013-2014
Turkey	 Catch up Education Program. 2008-2009. Ministry of National Education (MoNE) with EU and UNICEF support. 	 Technical Assistance for Increasing Primary School Attendance Rate of Children, 2013. KEP I "Girls Education Project". 2011 KEP II Technical Assistance for Increasing School Attendance Rates Especially for Girls (IAREFG) EuropeAid/133119/IH/SER/TR. 2015.

Table 4. Policies on ESL: National Projects and National Actions included in this report, by Country.

Austria

National Action:

National Action and Strategie for reducing the ESL-rate. BMBF (Bundesministerium für Bildung und Frauen). 2012. https://www.bmbf.gv.at/schulen/unterricht/ba/schulabbruch.html

This is a national action that includes studies, presentations, workshops, job coaching, a guide with recommendations for schools, pupils and parents to reduce the ESL-quote.

Youth Coaching. 2013. Federal Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Consumers Protection. https://www.bmbf.gv.at/schulen/unterricht/ba/schulabbruch_eslstrateg ie_24401.pdf?4dzgm2

In Austria's National Strategy for Preventing Early School Leaving was expressed the necessity of a national-wide support structure for children and youth. The structure is called "Youth Coaching", and is developed by the Federal Ministry of Labour, Social Affairs and Consumer's Protection in cooperation with the Federal Ministry of Art and Culture. The measure is already piloted since 2013 as a central component of the





Austrian National Strategy against school dropout, and the focus is set mainly on prevention, on early intervention and intensified cooperation between schools.

National project:

"Unentdeckte Talente" (Undiscovered Talents), it is a project from the Agency for Employment (AMS) in Austria. 2010-2016. <u>http://www.unentdeckte-talente.at/das-projekt/</u>

Studies and reports, presentations and workshops about Job-coaching, development of a platform for experts, a book where young people can share their experiences. One of the most significant result of this project was that youth coaches for job orientation become compulsory in schools.

> "I am I - a part of us". Healthy Austria Funds. 2000. http://www.fgoe.org/projektfoerderung/projektberichte

The schools implement the projects through the support of these funds in many schools and kindergartens in Austria. To find a solution to ESL and school dropout, the Healthy Austria Funds through the project "I am I – a part of US", which is currently being implemented in several secondary schools in Austria, promotes health through Emotional Education and creativity and aims to reduce ESL rates in schools and kinder gardens.

Belgium

National Action:

"Actieplan Vroegtijdig Schoolverlaten" (Action Plan Early School Leaving) Flanders, Belgium. 2014 http://www.ond.vlaanderen.be/secundair/Actieplan_Vroegtijdig_Schoolverlaten_def.pdf

Flemish government, The VDAB is the public employment service of Flanders, other organizations concerned with professional training for jobs (e.g. Syntra).

"Wallonian decree". Wallonia Government, 2014. http://www.gallilex.cfwb.be/document/pdf/39909_001.pdf

Organizing various school Devices promoting welfare of young people at the school, school attachment, the prevention of violence in schools and support approaches to school guidance.





This decree applies to basic and secondary education institutions, and ordinary specialized, organized or subsidized by the French Community, as well as psychological, medical and social centers. The purpose of this Order is to promote, within the the institutions mentioned bellow:

- Well-being of young people in school.
- School setting, including dropout prevention truancy and exclusion.
- Prevention of violence in schools.
- Support for school counseling approaches.

Measures to fight against school dropout in place by the Brussels Capital Region Public Service. Brussels Capital Region. 2015 http://bravvo.be/Nota-Bene-cellule-de-prevention-du-decrochage-scolaire

This national action is developed by the Public services, in cooperation with schools, and with 18 municipalities in Brussels Capital region and a special cell Nota Bene in Brussels City.

Note Bene provides:

- Support in the establishment or development of dropout prevention projects: design, research partners or stakeholders or subsidies, support to project progress.
- Awareness of animations on education, notably on the basis of a curriculum material on the school system, suitable for all age groups
- Expertise and information tools: list of schools, school legislation, factsheets, project inventories and actors.
- An inventory including an exhaustive list of resources and actors, a study of the problems and a compendium of best practices.
- Youth information sessions and professionals about the school system

National project:

In Belgium there are some local projects

"Roma Plus" developed by The training center Foyer in Brussels.

The training center Foyer in Brussels focuses on the project Roma Plus mainly young Roma. Roma stewards accompany these disadvantaged young people in their search for work and training.

The association Odyssée focuses on adolescent school dropouts, Brussels.

The association Odyssée focuses on adolescent school dropouts in Brussels. In collaboration with 17 schools are young people after an individual analysis escorted to still get a diploma or certificate. After the roundtable with the youngster and his parents





are working intensively on motivation and self-esteem. But there is also scope for prevention through group workshops for young people and training for teachers and educators. The jury believes in the individual approach and the hatch prevention.

The association Perspectives from Flémalle, Brussels.

The association Perspectives from Flémalle has been working 30 years for low-skilled and / or long-term unemployed. The project stage "Digital techniques" allows 12 unskilled young people between 18 and 25 years old to put a show around light and sound. For nine months, the young people are taught in a non-school but fun and motivating way on mathematics, electricity and IT.

"From chaos to zen". The association School Bridge.

The association School Bridge is the bridge between the school on the one hand, and socially vulnerable young people and their parents on the other side. The project From chaos to zen in class, they want to work together through an internal counseling with teachers, class groups and parents to prevent early school leaving. The jury believes in the individual analyzes of young people, the great parent involvement and prevention. Also, the formation of the teachers' contributes to the success of this project.

The project Tutoring. Association La Teignouse.

The association La Teignouse offers include preventive assistance to youth and their families in their own environment through personal or group projects. The proposed project Tutoring to grow about coaching: young students learning from older, more experienced classmates. In private sessions, a mentor between 18 and 25 years tries to answer all possible questions of youngsters between 12 and 16 years old. This approach creates a win-win situation for both parties

France

National action:

"Altogether to beat school dropout". 2014-2016. French Ministry of Education

President Hollande made tackling school dropout a priority in 2012, with the aim of halving the number of young early school leavers by 2017 and giving past dropouts a way back into education. Today, France is making progress towards this goal. The early French school leaving rate (9% - source Insee inquiry, DEPP calculations) is 1 point below the Europe 2020 Strategy target (10%) and 2 points below the European average (11%).




Following publication in November 2014 of the assessment of France's anti-dropout strategy, the Ministry of National Education, Higher Education and Research is spearheading a major national campaign against early school leaving under the leadership of the minister, Najat Vallaud-Belkacem.

Under the slogan "to mobilisés pour vaincre le décrochage" ("altogether to beat school dropout") – the plan coordinates action between the ministries in charge of education, employment, towns, health, agriculture and overseas departments, together with regional authorities, associations, researchers, and other interested parties including youngsters and their parents. Combined with other education ministry programs, particularly at the primary level and in priority education, it has three key themes:

Everyone concerned, schools, national and regional authorities, and parents are acting together against early school leaving. Awareness activities include:

- A special week, organised by education authorities under the slogan "Ensemble on s'accroche!" ("Together we hang in here"), to highlight successful initiatives.
- Schools and authorities collaborating to devise "anti-dropout" policies;
- Parents" involvement, especially at crucial times when their kids are changing school or choosing their specialist subjects.
- A dedicated helpline for pupils and relatives to consult specialised counsellors on alternative education streams and support.

Emphasis on prevention, with measures to identify students problems and find solutions from early childhood education and care onwards, such as:

- Specialised training for all staff.
- Collaboration between teachers, other educational workers and outside specialists.

A new chance for teenagers who fall behind at school, or have left empty-handed, to gain qualifications. Among measures are:

- A more flexible, module-based education system.
- Improved monitoring of students during their schooling.
- Advice for teens about the world of work and opportunities for professional experience.
- Setting up innovative remedial education services, such as "micro-lycées".
- The right for all dropouts to return to initial training, backed by the law.
- New initiatives for early school leavers such as voluntary military and civic service, and work.
- Experience in partnership with the ministry of defence, voluntary associations and public bodies.

Specialised anti-dropout Services:





- The *Mission de Lutte Contre le Décrochage Scolaire (MLDS) acts* to prevent early school leaving, help youngsters back into education to gain qualifications and support them during their studies.
- The SIEI, the Interministerial System of Information Exchanges, identifies early school leavers through cross-referencing national and ministry databases;
- Nationwide monitoring and support offices advise and help early school leavers to return to education or prepare for a working life. They coordinate local education, guidance and youth employment services, such as schools, the *MLDS, Centres d'information et d'orientation (COIs),* local initiatives, agricultural establishments, the adult education system Greta, youth information bureaux and regional authorities.
- Fo-QualE (Formation Qualification Emploi) networks are a collaboration between the MLDS and COIs to advise and support young people in finding appropriate educational avenues and advice; they are part of the "New chance" networks established in 2012.

National project:

Classes et dispositifs relais. 1998. 2002. Ministry of Education.

Two main actions: "classes et dispositifs relais" pretend: to help students to be interested back in learning, to go back to study or to get trained (general education or vocational education), to support skills and knowledge development, including civic competences.

There are two main programs: "classes relais" that were created in 1998 and "ateliers relais" that were created in 2002. They have the same objectives, but their difference reside in the kind of partnership and their duration. The "classes relais" are based on cooperation with the Ministry of Justice, though the "ateliers relais" are directly related to organisations that are accredited by the Ministry of Education. Both associate public institutions.

These two programs are installed in some secondary schools. In all the schools, the teachers and the teams working directly with the youngsters (social workers for example), can orientate the pupils to the schools having the specific programs. Once the parents or the legal representative agree, the authorities will study the records, and if everything is accepted, the students can join one of the specific programs. Depending on the program, it can last from 4 weeks to several months

Italy

National action:

Decree of the Ministry of Education 7th of February 2014 to strengthen tools and projects of schools to decrease the ESL.







http://www.cislscuola.it/fileadmin/cislscuola/content/Immagini_Articoli/ Magazzino/2014/02_2014/dm_prot_87_7feb_14.pdf

Two types of teaching actions are planned in this national action: the first addressed to groups of up to ten students, to whom there is the need to develop learning pathways on the recovery of the basic instruments; the second addressed to all pupils at the school, in particular for the organization of workshops which propose cultural, artistic, sporting or recreational activities.

Autorità Garante per l'Infanzia e l'Adolescenza. 2014. www.garanteinfanzia.org

This action aims to share experiences and best practices of the network of this authority and identifying places and actors of the public institutions in charge of the promotion and the financing projects against ESL.

National projects:

RI.ME.DI. - RIcerca MEtodologica DIdattica contro la dispersione scolastica" project. 2013-2014. Istituto Comprensivo Caronda di Catania. <u>http://www.scuolacaronda.gov.it/seminario-di-chiusura-delprogetto-pon-fse-ri-me-di-ricerca-metodologica-didattica-contro-ladispersione-scolastica-coro-di-notte-monastero-dei-benedettini-cat/</u>

The project set up a research initiative/action aimed at limiting the cases of failure/dropping/ early school leaving, and, at the same time, to prevent the emergence of such phenomena, developing an "early diagnosis" and "warning signs" of ESL.

Related to ESL, the project aimed to strengthen school and work experience alternating. To stem the high rates of school dropout by integrating in the last three years of upper secondary education a for school-work path for at least 400 hours in technical schools and professional and at least 200 total hours in high schools. The activities will also be held during the periods of suspension of activities: in summer and/or during the Christmas and Easter holidays.

"Le buone prassi contro la dispersione e per l"inclusione". Istituto Istruzione Superiore Artistica Classica Professionale. 2014-2015. <u>http://www.iisacp.gov.it/progetto-art-9-contro-la-dispersione-</u> <u>scolastica-per-le-scuole-collocate-in-aree-a-rischio/</u>

The project aims at preventing the phenomenon of ESL, consolidating the integration and inclusion, educating to the culture of solidarity, tolerance and sharing, enhancing learning through ICT methodologies, preventing risk behaviors. The project uses new





disposals and tools to enhance and promote an innovative teaching methodology, based on ICTs.

General actions are found on the prevention and fight school drop-out, from all forms of discrimination and bullying, even computer; enhancement of school inclusion and the right to education of pupils with special educational needs through individualized and customized courses with the support and collaboration of health and social services and education of the territory and of industry associations and the application of the guidelines to promote the right to education of pupils adopted, issued by the Ministry of education, university and research December 18, 2014.

"Progetto dispersione". Istituto Comprensivo 2 "S. D'Acquisto. 2013-2014. http://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?q=cache:http://www.i csalvodacquisto.it/pon/images/dispersione_2013.pdf&gws_rd=cr&ei= Fav7VqHcOYKXsAHthqf4Dg

The project supports the curricular activity within schools so that they become an active agent in the process of stimulating and empowering the pupils. The project aims at reintegrating the pupils in risk of ESL in the educative pathway thanks to specific activities that suit them.

"Fuoriclasse". Fondazione Agnelli. 2012-2013. http://www.savethechildren.it/IT/Tool/Press/Single?id_press=553&yea r=2013

The extracurricular spaces dedicated, as the two new centres of Scalea and Crotone, and the involvement of teachers and parents, represent the added value of an innovative intervention that focuses on the connection between the school context and out of school, in which the activities are initiated in the school to continue its exterior using methodologies that refer both to formal education than to the non-formal, and can reach the target of the project in the various reference contexts with different approaches.

> "Progetto In-Contro". Save the Children Italia. 2010. http://images.savethechildren.it/IT/f/img_pubblicazioni/img147_b.pdf

The project led some workshops aimed at preventing early school leaving and research among students. They were organized a refresher course and seminars with the teachers, who were able to reflect and acquire tools to counter the risk of early school leaving. The opening of a low-threshold day centre have promoted various activities (workshops, school support, meetings with speech therapists, trips outside their neighborhoods, sports activities, and, at this late stage, a centre and a summer camp), who secured 350 of the 800 children to improve their school performance and their





sociability. Finally, the project included the recovery of 40 children who had not been able to enroll in the CFP due to the failure number of places: some of them have been incorporated into other vocational training centres, while the other has proposed a guidance path to work through the COL (career guidance centre) of the XII Municipio, thus avoiding the risk of entry into of black labour.

Portugal

National action:

Choices Program. 2001-present. Council of Ministers, integrated into the High Commission for Immigration and Intercultural Dialogue (Alto Comissariado para a Imigração e Diálogo Intercultural) – ACIDI, IP. http://www.programaescolhas.pt/enquadramento

Its mission is to promote social inclusion of children and teenagers coming from vulnerable or unstable socio-economic contexts, aiming towards equality of opportunities and the reinforcement of social cohesion and non-formal learnings. Now, in its call for the 6th generation, the Choices program holds protocols with 110 local social inclusion programs in vulnerable communities, with an option to finance an additional 30 projects, many of which located in areas where there are large numbers of descendants of immigrants and ethnic minorities.

National project:

PMSE - Stands for Plus Scholar Success Programme (Programa Mais Sucesso Escolar). http://www.dge.mec.pt/sites/default/files/EPIPSE/edital_regulamento_ mais_sucesso_escolar2.pdf http://www.dge.mec.pt/sites/default/files/EPIPSE/decreto_lei_139_20 12_de_5_de_julho.pdf

It is based on initiatives taken by vertical school groups that were transformed in public policies by the Ministry of Education, and its purpose is to support schools in the actions" implementation to improve scholar success through non-formal education practices. There were three different segments within the program: Fénix nests, Plus Classroom and Hybrid type.

The project that retains the biggest slice of the participants is the Plus Classroom, followed by Fenix and Hybrid, revealing a slight decline in the period under analysis. The Plus Classroom type presents a decreasing number of participants around 36% and Fenix around 28%, while Hybrid gets a rise in 4%, between 2009/2010 and 2012/2013. In the same time span, there was a decline in the overall students involved in 29% of total participants in PMSE programme. Regarding the number of teachers participating in the three projects, it is worth to note the increase in 51% of teachers within PlusClassroom project from 2010 to 2011 and the decrease of 38% in the Hybrid type, from 2012 to 2013.





In 6th grade (part of the ISCED 1 cycle and age group with 12 years old), the results are higher than the national average marks in the Portuguese exam of the projects Fenix and Plus Classroom (1.4% and 0.8%, respectively). Regarding the Mathematics subject, the results are lower than the national average (-0.1% and -5.1%). In 9th grade, only the Hybrid type of project shows higher values than the national average either in Portuguese and Mathematics (13.6% and 6.4%). The Fenix project, on the other hand, it got a performance below the national average in the same subjects in less 10.6% and less 9.3% and the Plus Classroom initiative less 7.4% and -1.1%, respectively.

The Directorate-General for Education adjusted the Vocational Courses to give support to the extension of the mandatory school since it guides students towards their vocational interests which will prevent early school leaving and promote a successful school path. For basic school levels, it allows learning in a practical way, at the same time, to the secondary students enable to get a double professional qualification, namely a professional qualification in level IV and the possibility to go forward to the University.

Spain

National action:

General plan to reduce early school leaving. 2014-2020 (http://www.mecd.gob.es/dms/mecd/educacion-mecd/areaseducacion/sistema-educativo/estudios-sistemaseducativos/espanol/especificos/estrategia-competenciasocde/documentacion/Plan-para-la-reducci-n-del-abandono-eductivotemprano.pdf)

Looking at Spanish national rates of ESL, the Ministry of Education has promoted a general plan to reduce ESL in Spain.

The strategic lines will be in effect between 2014 and 2016, and they may be revised, expanded or modified in subsequent plans, and are as follows:

- To create conditions that guarantee the permanence and success in the education system, especially those vulnerable citizens.
- To enhance the conditions that promote the effective permanence in training activities leading to levels at least equal to the necessary training by European standards.
- To promote systems of a second chance and support mechanisms incorporating lifelong learning habits in adult life.
- To identify, analyse and intervene early on factors affecting school failure.
- To expand the access to information, guidance and quality academic and professional counselling, to facilitate citizens making personal decisions about their training, education and professional qualification process.
- To raise awareness and train professionals who can intervene with citizens at risk of early school leaving.





- To promote recognition systems key competencies for learning throughout life.
- To promote more flexible forms of access to education and training.

National project:

PROA Plan. Program for the support, orientation and help against school leaving. Ministry of Education. 2005-2011. <u>http://www.mecd.gob.es/educacion-mecd/areas-</u> educacion/comunidades-autonomas/programas-cooperacion/planproa/lineas-actuacion-proa.html

This program aimed to overcome the difficulties that some students have to the transition between Primary and Secondary education, promoting the coordination of the schools involved in the process and including the families in this process. This plan helps students with problems during school hours. This program included ICT resources to control the students absence and try to identify risk situations. In 2007 the Ministry of Education presented some results of this program implemented in 2005-2006.

More than 81 percent of education professionals (tutors, management teams, advisers) think that PROA has reduced ESL in Primary and Secondary. The 82.56 percent of students with learning difficulties and/or socio-educational integration involved in this plan of the Ministry of Education and Science and all regions say they came to class with the homework done. In 2007 the project had been reduced the absence to 2%.

"Avoid gipsy ESL". 2013-2014

There is a national action developed for Gypsy students. Statistics show that there is a significant percentage of gipsy students that do not finish the Secondary school.

This action is coordinated by different organisations funded by the Spanish Ministry of Education. The general goal was to monitor and support gipsy students from primary education to compulsory secondary education. The Union of Romani Foundation, aimed at students with poor education and, high risk of absenteeism will make the transition to compulsory secondary education (ESO). A global intervention program for the gipsy community involved Spanish Gypsy Organizations, to achieve academic success and to make possible the continuation in subsequent studies.

Turkey:

National action:

Catch up Education Program. 2008-2009. Ministry of National Education (MoNE) with EU and UNICEF support. <u>http://erg.sabanciuniv.edu/en/node/70</u>





Catch up Education is an accelerated learning programme and developed with the support of EU and UNICEF. The Program aims to secure the right to education of 10–14 years old children and who never had access to education, dropped out from school or are at least 3 years behind their peers.

Programme reaches out to girls and boys from some of the most disadvantaged social groups from girls in remote villages to urban Roma children and other children, including disabled children, with impoverished family backgrounds.

National project:

Technical Assistance for Increasing Primary School Attendance Rate of Children, 2013. <u>http://mebidap.meb.gov.tr/en</u>

'This project aims to increase the enrollment rates in primary education for the first 8 years of the 12-year compulsory education. Target group of the project is policy makers, opinion leaders, parent-teacher associations, imams and other relevant actors, students, teachers, school administrators, Inspectors.

It is positive that compulsory education is extended to twelve years. Another positive aspect is that online and electronic systems like "e-school" and "e-investment" have substantially increased the monitoring capacity of the central organisation, but there have been no major gains in school autonomy.

To improve the monitoring of children's enrollment in school, an Address-Based Population Registry System and the e-school database was seized. Also, MoNE has developed a Non-Attendance Management Model to identify the risks of non-attendance and to monitor and respond to non-attendance. (Available from: http://mebidap.meb.gov.tr/en)

KEP I "Girls Education Project". 2011.

http://mebidap.meb.gov.tr/en

KEP I aims to focus on girls education to promote higher and longer quality education. Target groups of the KEP I are children and their families, education professionals, local opinion leaders and bureaucrats.

> KEP II Technical Assistance for Increasing School Attendance Rates Especially for Girls (IAREFG) EuropeAid/133119/IH/SER/TR. 2015.

> > http://mebidap.meb.gov.tr/en

KEP II aims to increase the school attendance rates, particularly for girls. Target groups of the KEP II are; children and their families, education professionals, local opinion leaders and bureaucrats.







100% primary school participation has not been achieved yet. Some girls still drop out in the upper grades of primary education. Main components of the drop outs are; poverty and conservative social norms, low expectation





Evaluation of skills of Secondary teachers

In this part of the Desk Research, we are going to present data about how skills of secondary teachers are evaluated in every country of the CARMA partnership. It is important to highlight that we have taken into account only national frameworks implemented in every country in general. We have not taken in account evaluations or process developed in particular regions. The aim of this part is to show a general view about national frameworks for the assessment of teachers' competences.

General Data

UNIVERSIDAD DE MURCIA

The data analysis about the evaluation of skills of secondary teachers shows us that the situation in every country is different, but there are some general common aspects to take into the account.

We coudn't find a national Framework to evaluate teachers' competencies in all 7 countries of the partnership.. Still, a certain Framework for assessing teachers' competencies already exists in each of the 7 countries.

In the case of Spain, Italy, Turkey, France and Portugal there is national framework provided by the Ministry of Education. In the case of Belgium, they take an international framework called TALES. Despite the fact that, in Spain, there is a national framework, they make TALIS too because their national framework is only related to digital skills.

Another common aspect is the aim of the evaluation framework. In general, the main goals of all of them are:

- To improve the teacher training.
- To be a part of the professional development of teachers.
- To assess and certificate teachers' competencies.
- All of them concrete a set of competencies organised into different levels.
- In some of them not only teachers are taken into account for the evaluations process, but also schools are part of these assessments.
- In some of them external and internal assessment procedures are included.

Data by country

In this section we are going to explain how each participant country evaluates the competencies of teachers. For Belgium, there is no national policy or programme that evaluates teachers' competencies.







Country	Secondary Teachers' Skills Evaluation Programmes
Austria	TALIS in Austria
Belgium	 No national policy nor programme.
France	 Compétences communes à to us Les professeurs et personnels d'éducation
Italy	Valorizza Project
Portugal	Continuous TrainingSpecialized Training
Spain	Common Framework foof Digital Skills For TeachersTALIS in Spain
Turkey	General Teacher CompetenciesIntel Teach Advanced Online Programme

Table 5. Secondary Teachers' Skills Evaluation Programmes included on this Report by Country.

Austria

In Austria, there is no institution that evaluates the competencies of teachers, the evaluation is made by each school, and there is an internal evaluation and external evaluation.

TALIS in Austria

TALIS is an International Survey provided by OCDE established in 2013. This survey offers an opportunity for teachers and school leaders to have their say in 6 areas:

- Learning environment.
- Appraisal and feedback.
- Teaching practices and classroom environment.
- Development and support.
- School leadership.
- Self-efficacy and job satisfaction.

The findings are representative for over 5 million teachers in 34 countries surveyed in 2013. The OECD is now planning for TALIS 2018. The themes covered by TALIS 2018 are likely to be similar to those explored in TALIS 2013 but the number of countries participating is already superior to 40.

Starting with 2008 Austria takes part in TALIS: Teaching and Learning International Survey organised by OECD. BIFIE is in charge of the implementation of the TALIS study in Austria.

On the other and, in Austria there are few teachers that have been internally or externally evaluated in the last 5 years. In the Austrian school-evaluation system, the relationship





teacher-student and the feedback from the parents are of great importance. Most of the teachers/ their competences should be at least 1 or 2 times per year evaluated. However, in Austria, only 31% of teachers of secondary schools were internally evaluated, much less than in other EU-countries. Regarding external evaluations, 57% of the teachers were at least 1 time evaluated. In the category of at least one monthly external evaluation, Austria registers only 2% of evaluated teachers.

Belgium

Teacher Education institutions in Flanders are free to choose the way of how to assess the competences of teachers. There is no strict national policy on assessment of teacher in Teacher Education or when in service.

Teachers are not assessed by national inspectors or any national actors. Schools do have to show a clear policy on how they evaluate the performance of the teachers during summative performance reviews and evaluations of their performance.

The government just issued a competence profile that TE institutions should pursue in their programmes. These competences are clustered in 10 Job specifications and attitudes. By decree, these have to be the object of assessments in Teacher Education programmes and of performance reviews and evaluations in schools.

Teacher Career Profile:

- 1. The teacher as guide in learning and development processes.
- 1.1 Find out the starting situation of the learners and the group;

1.2 Choose and formulate objectives;

1.3 Select curriculum contents or learning experiences;

1.4 Structure curriculum contents or learning experiences and translate them into a coherent educational provision;

1.5 Determine an adjusted methodical approach and grouping arrangement;

1.6 Select, adjust and develop teaching materials in a team;

1.7 Create an appropriate learning environment which pays attention to the heterogeneity within the group of learners;

1.8 Prepare observations or evaluations;

1.9 Observe or evaluate the process and product;

1.10 Carry out special needs initiatives in consultation with the team and have them link up with the school's overall approach;

1.11 Guide the learning and development process in Standard Dutch;

1.12 Handle the diversity of the group.

2. The teacher as educator

2.1 Together with the team, create a positive social climate for learners in a classroom context and at school;

2.2 Stimulate the emancipation of learners;

2.3. Prepare learners for individual development and social participation through attitude formation;

2.4 Use current social developments in a teaching context;





2.5 Deal appropriately with learners in socio-emotional problem situations and with learners experiencing behavioural difficulties;

2.6 Promote the physical and mental health of learners;

2.7 Communicate with learners from different backgrounds in diverse linguistic situations.

3. The teacher as subject matter expert

3.1 Broaden and deepen the basic knowledge of the curriculum contents, including at least the developmental objectives and attainment targets;

3.2 Follow, analyse and process recent developments regarding contents and skills from the areas of learning or subject areas;

3.3 Use the acquired knowledge and skills with regard to areas of learning and subject areas;

3.4 Situate his or her own training provision in the overall educational provision, especially the related levels and special education, with the aim of providing guidance and orientation to learners, and the teacher is acquainted with the existing forms of integration between mainstream and special education.

4. The teacher as organiser

4.1 Promote a structured working atmosphere;

4.2 Ensure that the lesson or day proceeds smoothly and efficiently, in accordance with a short and long-term planning;

4.3 Duly carry out administrative tasks;

4.4 Create a stimulating and workable classroom, taking account of the learners' safety.

5. The teacher as innovator – the teacher as researcher

5.1 Acquaint him or herself with educational research results;

5.2 Introduce innovative elements by questioning his or her own school culture and training concepts in a constructive manner, and by reflecting on new social developments and educational research results;

5.3 Innovate his or her own classroom practice on the basis of in-service training, and his or her own experience and creativity;

5.3 Question and adjust his or her own functioning.

6. The teacher as partner of parents or carers

6.1 Acquaint him or herself with information about the learner and handle it discreetly;6.2 Following consultation with colleagues, give parents or carers information and advice about their child at school;

6.3 In consultation with the team, inform parents or carers about what goes in the classroom and at school and involve them in it, whilst taking account of the diversity among the parents;

6.4 Talk with parents or carers about education and upbringing;

6.5 Communicate with parents from different language backgrounds in diverse linguistic situations.

7. The teacher as member of a school staff team

7.1 Participate in the elaboration of the school development plan;

7.2 Participate in cooperative structures;

7.3 Deliberate on a division of tasks within the team and respect it;







7.4 Bring his or her own teaching and educational duty and approach up for discussion within the team;

7.5 Gather information about his or her own legal security and that of the learner.

8. The teacher as partner of external parties

8.1 Make contacts, communicate and collaborate with external bodies that provide education-related initiatives.

- 9. The teacher as member of the education community
- 9.1 Take part in the social debate on educational themes;
- 9.2 Reflect on the teaching profession and his or her place in society.
 - 10. The teacher as culture participant

10.1 Distinguish topical themes and developments and adopt a critical attitude towards the following domains:

10.1.1 The socio-political domain

10.1.2 The socio-economic domain

- 10.1.3 The philosophical domain
- 10.1.4 The cultural-aesthetic domain

10.1.5 The cultural-scientific domain.

Professional attitudes

The following professional attitudes apply to all job specifications

- Decisiveness
- Relational orientation
- Critical reflection
- Eagerness to learn
- Organisational skills
- Sense of collaboration
- Sense of responsibility
- Flexibility

France

In France, there is a national framework provided by the Ministère de l'éducation Nationale.

Compétences communes à to us Les professeurs et personnels d'éducation

It is a set of competencies, organised in 2 levels: a general one for any teacher, and also a specific one depending on the teaching.

There are two main lists of skills, one of them is for teachers and academic staff and another one only for teachers. Following we present these lists of skills:

- Common skills to all teachers and academic staff.
 - To share the values of the Republic.
 - To enter its action in the context of the basic education principles and the regulatory environment of the school.
 - To know the students and the learning process.
 - To take into account the diversity of students.





- To support students in their learning path.
- To take into account ethical principles.
- To master the French language for communication purposes.
- To use a foreign language in situations demanded by his profession.
- To integrate the elements of digital culture necessary for the exercise of his profession.
- To cooperate with a team.
- \circ $\,$ To contribute to the work of the educational community.
- To cooperate with parents.
- To cooperate with school partners.
- To engage in an individual approach and collective professional development.
- Common skills to all teachers.
 - To master the subject knowledge and their teaching.
 - \circ $\,$ To master the French language in the context of his teaching.
 - To build, implement and lead teaching and learning situations taking into account the diversity of students.
 - To organise and ensure group work and socialisation of students.
 - To assess progress and achievement of students.
 - To master the knowledge and skills specific to media education and information.
 - To implement the documentary policy of the institution.
 - To contribute to the opening of the school on the educational, cultural and professional environment, local and regional, national, European and international.
 - To organise the living conditions of students in the school, their safety, quality of the material organisation and time management.
 - To promote and coordinate the educative component of the school plan.
 - To ensure the responsibility of the organisation.
 - To follow the path of the student on education and educationally.
 - To serve students, particularly in their training for participatory citizenship.
 - To participate in the construction of student course.
 - To work in a team.

Italy

In Italy, there is a national framework provided by the Ministry of Education, Universities and Research. This framework is called Valorizza.

Valorizza Project:

Valorizza is a project of the assessment of individual teachers in which the main goal is to identify and reward teachers who are distinguished by a general and proven professional appreciation within each school.

The experiment was carried out in the academic year 2010-2011 in 33 schools of Campania, Lombardia and Piemonte.





Procedures:

The procedures were as follows: the 33 schools of various kinds and levels have had voluntarily candidates; only teachers who have requested it was evaluated (about twothirds of those serving in the schools involved); the evaluation was managed within schools, not from external parties. Each school has identified an "internal assessment team" constituted by the head teacher and two teachers.

In this project, different instruments of assessment have been implemented:

- Members of the "internal evaluation team", independently, have made a judgment about direct knowledge of the candidates and their reputation.
- A self-assessment questionnaire for applicants.
- A curriculum vitae of the candidates.
- Indications from the parents of pupils through a questionnaire.
- In some schools, indications of students in the fourth and fifth year of secondary level through questionnaires.

Concluded the examination of the materials, the team came together with the presence of a ministerial expert to locate the 30% of the candidates who were considered particularly deserving (with at least two favourable reviews out of three).

The results (as in the research report) have allowed defining a mode of evaluation that, in every school, has considered several contributions to the development of a judgment starting from "subjective" angles. The reliability, according to the authors of the project, was born from the spontaneous convergence of multiple appreciations.

Portugal

In Portugal, there are two main frameworks, both of them related to the teachers' training.

Continuous training.

Continuous training is an annual evaluation provided by the Ministry of Education-Scientific Council for Teachers' Evaluation (CCAP).

The assessment focuses on two teaching dimensions:

- An evaluation focused on scientific and pedagogical quality of the teaching, based on the demonstrated skills, conducted by the department coordinator.
- A second evaluation, carried out by the executive board, which evaluates the performance of the academic and non-academic services (assiduity), the participation of teachers in school life (e.g. pedagogical practices), the educational progress and achievement of students and teacher's contribution to the reduction of early school leaving, lifelong learning, the relationship with the community (particularly parents and guardians), among others.





Moreover, the observation class is optional in the regular assessment and must be required by the teacher. Usually, this happens whenever a teacher aspires to progress in his/her career to a certain level, which in turns the teacher needs a grade of "very good" or "excellent".

Specialised Training.

Specialised training is also an annual evaluation provided by the Scientific and Pedagogical Council of Continuous Training.

Under the Legal Regime of Continuous Teachers' Training, the Scientific and Pedagogical Council of Continuous Training shall make the accreditation of training providers and training activities for teachers and monitor the process of evaluation of the training system. It is also responsible for accreditation of specialised training courses.

Each school must publish their training plan on time (for one school year) regarding the schools' needs. From these demands, the training centres adjust their supplies.

If a teacher from ISCED 1 or 2 levels aspires to become a secondary teacher (ISCED 3), he/she must go back to university and get a higher degree with a specific ramification - e.g. mathematics, geography, etc.

As much training a teacher collects, as much credits she gains, improving the likelihood to progress in career. Nevertheless, all the training must be provided by centres and certificated by the Pedagogical Council of Continuous Training.

Spain

In Spain, there are two frameworks related to the assessment of teachers' competences.

The Ministry of Education provides one framework related to digital skills and the other one, as in Austria, is the international framework called TALIS.

A common framework of digital skills for teachers.

This framework started in 2013. The aim of the project is to present a common framework that can work as an example for future teaching plans for teachers, and even for the assessment of teachers related to digital skills.

- To facilitate a common framework to describe digital competencies.
- To improve the digital competencies in teachers.
- To have a list of minimum abilities that teachers need related to ICT.
- To help teachers to assess the digital competence.
- To change methodological aspects in education, thanks to the implementation of ICT.

Also in this framework there are three main lines of action:

- Common framework.
- Plan to assess and certificate teachers and schools.





• Improving digital ICT.

TALIS in Spain.

One significant result of TALIS for Spanish teachers was the percentage of teachers that collaborate with others, specifically going to other colleague classes or collaborating by providing help or feedback to other colleagues. In Spain, some conclusions of this project are:

- Teachers do not participate with others in activities related to the school. Courses they received are related to personal interests, not environmental interests.
- Teachers do not use active methodologies in class.
- Teachers do not research in class.
- 3/4 teachers say they never or almost never follow activities to improve professional aspects.
- Teachers can collaborate sharing resources or materials, but not sharing activities or developing projects together. Spain is the country that shows the biggest difference in these aspects, so, it is the country with the lowest level in professional collaboration, but the highest level in exchange materials.
- Teachers that teach Maths show a particular point of view about teaching and their activity as teachers.
- Teachers who collaborate are more satisfied with their work.

Turkey

In Turkey there are two frameworks, one of them is related to the generic teachers' competencies provided by the Ministry of Education and the other one is specific about technology and provided by Intel & Ministry of National Education.

Generic Teacher Competencies.

The Generic teacher competencies is a framework provided by the Turkish Republic Ministry of National Education, General Directorate of Teacher Training. A set of studies have been conducted to specify the teacher competencies under provisions of Article 45 of Basic Law of National Education No. 1739.

The aim is the development of teacher's status. Generic Teacher Competencies specifies the knowledge, skills and attitudes required to perform the teaching profession effectively and efficiently. Teacher Competencies are developed:

- To contribute to achieving targets of national education.
- To carry out more effective cooperation and share of information at national level.
- To establish a structure/system for comparison of teacher qualifications.
- To try to establish consistent social expectations concerning status and quality of the teaching profession.





- To establish a clear, understandable and reliable source for the professional development of teachers.
- To reach a consensus at the national level regarding terminology and definitions to be used for the discussions on the teaching profession.
- To define knowledge, skills, attitudes and values of teachers and to try to raise their status in the eyes of the society by creating awareness.
- To create opportunities for students to "learn how to learn".
- To set up quality insurance for parents and society by ensuring that the teaching profession is more transparent.

(Turkish Republic Ministry Of National Education, 2006, General Directorate Of Teacher Training SBEP: Support To Basic Education Project, "Teacher Training Component", Generic Teacher Competencies, Ankara. Available from: http://otmg.meb.gov.tr/belgeler/otmg/Generic_Teacher_Competencies.pdf)

"Generic Teacher Competencies" is one of the most significant studies as it serves for the Generic competencies consist of six main competencies composed by 31 subcompetencies and 233 performance indicators.

- Personal and Professional Values-Professional Development.
- Knowing the Student.
- Learning and Teaching Process.
- Monitoring and Evaluation of Learning and Development.
- School-Family and Society Relationships.
- Knowledge of Curriculum and Content.

Teacher Competencies provide a common understanding of objective among the Ministry of National Education, Board of Higher Education, Institutions of Higher Education for Teacher Training, Non-Governmental Organisations, Democratic Organisations, Teachers, Parents and all sections of the society.

(Turkish Republic Ministry Of National Education, 2006, General Directorate Of Teacher Training SBEP: Support To Basic Education Project, "Teacher Training Component", Generic Teacher Competencies, Ankara. Available from: <u>http://otmg.meb.gov.tr/belgeler/otmg/Generic Teacher Competencies.pdf</u>)

Intel Teach - Advanced Online" programme.

The "Intel Teach - Advanced Online" programme is designed to help school teachers to effectively integrate technology into learning and teaching, and to help students develop 21st Century Skills. The programme has been deployed as part of a joint effort between Intel Corporation and the Ministry of National Education.

The blended learning programme, based on an online platform focusing on innovative teaching practices and learning styles, aims to:

- improve the learning and teaching experience;
- encourage collaboration among teachers, pupils and institutions;







• promote a virtual learning and collaboration environment.

The core concept of the programme is the Learning Path, an iterative process integrating lesson plans and project-based approaches, created and continuously improved by peers. Teachers are asked to integrate learning paths into their teaching, and then to reflect and self-evaluate methods and suggest improvements.

Teacher skills required to implement the Learning Path are:

- innovative teaching methods;
- inquiry and problem-based learning approaches;
- interdisciplinary instructional design;
- digital skills to add pedagogical value to the deployment of online tools in the classroom;
- instructional design to promote collaboration, communication, innovation and critical thinking in the learning paths;
- formative and summative assessment techniques.

Additional skills that the teachers will learn include:

- work on a common topic across subjects, coordinate their activities within the chosen Learning Path;
- the six steps approach to problem-based learning;
- the 5E model of instruction;
- digital storytelling.

The "Intel Teach - Advanced Online" programme is designed to take place over an extended period, improving innovative teaching skills, supporting interaction among master teachers and providing opportunities for teachers to try out new teaching methods and styles in a safe environment to receive feedback from peers. While using the programme, the teachers' development was measured in many ways, including weekly evaluation and collaboration meetings, surveys and interviews about the impact of the training, classroom visits and videos monitoring implementation, the provision of extra professional development training to improve teaching skills and the creation of collaboration communities amongst them. Overall, there are high hopes for the professional development of teachers when the Learning Path Platform is disseminated, and more teachers begin using the "Intel Teach - Advanced Online" programme.

schools; 130 teachers were eventually selected. After five days of training, 40 master teachers were identified, and 50 learning paths were created. The teachers were actively engaged in the creation of the learning paths. Starting in February 2015, by end of the same year the learning path platform had been deployed to 10,000 teachers.



Good Practices in Collaborative Learning

Grupo de Investigación de Tecnología Educativa

Jniversidad de Murcia

Our outcome is to search and catalogue practices with non-formal methodologies based on collaborative work in contexts of Secondary Education. Each and every partner has

to find one practice as a minimum with the characteristic that it has to be a good practice because of its design or its results. Another condition of these examples to be considered as good practices is to have been tested in the real context.

UNIVERSIDAD DE MURCIA

To collect all data, the team of University of Murcia, Coordinator of WP2, has design a Google Form with these items (see figure bellow): 1) one closed questions -with seven options to answerabout partners and 2) seven questions about the collaborative practice itself (description and general information).

	is Form is to collect good practices in collaborative learning (see the Desk Research proposal if you have any que contact to <isabeigp@um.es>).</isabeigp@um.es>
Pa	artner
1.	CESIE
2.	University of Murcia
3.	PISTES SOLIDAIRES
4.	ASİST ÖĞRETİM KURUMLARI A.Ş.
5.	University College Leuven (UC Leuven)
6.	INOVAMAIS S.A
7.	Verein Multikulturell
т	TLE
Sh	ort-enswer text
	RL ort-answer text
м	ain Goals
Lo	ig answer text
	ontext and participants (Age of the students/Number of students / group: chools)
Lo	ng ensiver text
	escription (Subject/Type of tasks, procedures, development of the good actice/ Tools and strategies used)
Lo	ng-answer text
	nal results (Assessment of competences of students/Assessment of illaboration/ Evidences, public resources)
Lo	rg-answer text

Figure 11. Form on line to collect Good Collaborative Practices (on Google Drive).

COLLECTION OF PRACTICES BY EVERY PARTNER

Partner	Number Of	Practices (Title)
	practices	· · ·
Verein Multikulturell (Austria)	1	Stop Dropout (1)
Asist Ogretim (Turkey)	2	Innovative teachers programme (2) ITAO- Intel Teach – Advanced Online Programme (3)
CESIE (Italy)	3	European mythology (4) Consolidating Higher Education Experience of Reform: norms, networks and good practice in Italy (CHEER) (5) ITIS Majorana School (6)
Pistes Solidaires	1	TOUKOULEUR (7)
Univ. of Murcia (Spain)	3	The ESL learning (8) From a mathematical view (9) Collaborative Develop of Competences (10)
Inovamais (Portugal)	1	Fenix Methodology (11)
Univ. College Leuven (Belgium)	1	Cooperative learning in multicultural groups (12)
TOTAL	12	
Figure 12. Good pr	actices collected b	y every partner.

Figure 12. Good practices collected by every partne

ANALYSIS OF PRACTICES

To analyse the information collected in this part of the Desk Research, we are going to present the main information summarised in tables and we are going to remark with red colour the key words to obtain our reflections and conclusions

1. ABOUT MAIN GOALS.

We can find two experiences (1 and 11) about the reduction of dropout, being one of them about students with learning difficulties. The majority of them try to promote collaboration between teachers and also between students, but it is interesting to emphasise the cases 3, 5, 7 and 11 where other educational agents are involved in the development of the experience. We can find 7 experiences about students' skills (1, 3, 6, 8, 9, 10 and 12) and only one (case 2) about teachers' skills. Finally, we can emphasise that examples 4, 6, 8, 9 and 10 are based on ICT applications to educational system. The key words to analyze data are in red colour.

CASE	MAIN GOALS
1	to reduce the ESL rate in the school system and adult education
2	Develop teachers' skills with collaborative learning

nd learning styles to improve the
on among teachers, pupils and
and collaboration environment, an
ing objects, requires teachers to
and then to reflect and self-evaluate
tes effective practices and reflective
n
between the various actors and
/ responses between the national,
each other. Encourages students to
ess.
ased on collaborative teaching and ince interaction and collaboration
pped with an interactive whiteboard,
dent (PCs or tablets). Teachers
earning materials.
cher, parents, ngo, student)
on about their school or city working
are the information Working with
eaking and writing Encouraging
ing/learning English Promoting
k Valuing the sociocultural side of
_
a collaborative experience among
hers (second level of collaboration).
ut mathematics; encourage the use
Education students in the frame of
of Maths and Language.
5th, this program aims to improve
ut in ISCED 1 and 2, based on
nised support among students with ose to improve students' learning
avoiding early school leaving and
was also created a monitoring
engaged along the implementation
uite popular in Flemish primary
of strategies used for the
pjects are a means to promote
ntly allow equal access to learning.
n study addresses some of CLIM's
emic participation in student
pretical principles and didactic
are addressed next, followed by
ne conclusions of the qualitative

CASE MAIN GOALS

analyses of the social and academie participation of the students are presented next. Finally, the role of the teacher is discuseed.

2. CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS.

In summary, these data show that participants are overall teachers and students. Only case 1 explain the participation of trainers and counsellors. Only one example is with university educational agents.

It is strange that there is no information about experiences involving other stakeholders or educational agents, but some of them described this aim in the item above explained.

We cannot compare quantitative data of participants in each example because some of the partners have not included this information.

CASE	CONTEXT & PARTICIPANTS
1	teachers and trainers, counsellors
2	Ministry of Education (MEB) teachers
3	Intel Teach – Advanced Online platform is a virtual learning area that nurtures the work of faculty and supports their collective engagement. It is also used to share ideas, expertise, and digital learning resources. The core concept of the programme is the Learning Path, an iterative process integrating lesson plans and project-based approaches, created and continuously improved by peers. Teachers are asked to integrate learning paths into their teaching, and then to reflect and self-evaluate methods and suggest improvements. Teachers' views of themselves as capable of generating knowledge about children and learning and the practice of teaching enhance their identity as professionals.
4	The classes involved in this project were two 4th grade and one 5th grade classes from a primary school in Rome; and one 6th grade class from a junior secondary school in Milan (aged 9–11). Six teachers (two with experience of CLE, and four with no experience) supported the students in the collaborative work within Synergeia2. The project lasted 20 weeks, approximately 2 h per week, both in the classroom and in the computer lab.
5	University students and faculty members. Universities: • University of Tor Vergata • National Dance Academy • University of Roma Tre • University of Bologna • University of Pisa
6	110 teacher and 1200 students (secondary school) Creation of e-books involve over 100 schools from across Italy
7	112 students aged between 13 & 14 years old. Collège Les Bréguières, 06800 CAGNES- SUR-MER
8	Secondary students (open to other levels). There are participating 12 centres.
9	First level: 120 students from 5 Spanish secondary schools. Second level: all their teachers
10	First year of Secondary Education. 12-13 years old students. More than 200 students from 8 different Secondary School were involved.
11	The Programme officially started in 2009/2010 with 46 organic units across the country and decreasing slightly for 38 units in 2012/2013. These units watched for 5 156 students in 2009/2010, which has dropped for 4 620 in 2010/2011, 4 400 in 2011/2012 and 3 693 in 2012/2013. The students groups ranged from 9 years to 16 years old. The number of classes had not a linear behaviour, starting with 247 classrooms in 2009/2010, dropping to

CASE	CONTEXT & PARTICIPANTS
	207 in the following year, rising again in 2011/2012 for 231 classrooms and then diminishing for 207 classrooms engaged within the project in 2012/2013. To what concerns the
	teachers, there were 727 teachers involved in the first edition of the Fenix Methodology with a linear descendent behaviour until 2012/2013 in which only 413 teachers have participated.
12	Students from 6 to 16 years old.

3. DESCRIPTION

This item of the form includes information about different topics of interest about these good practices like subject, tasks, procedures, development, tools and strategies. In summary, we have found significative differences among the described experiences, so in the end, we have a mosaic of practices that makes them an attractive group of proposals. In summary, we have:

- electronic tools to prevent dropout plus a flexible prevention system of counselling,
- two teachers' training programs, one of them based on an online learning platform with digital resources
- one experience to promote distance education
- questionnaires about learning objectives
- collaborative strategies among teachers and students to create learning materials and design e-books
- work on the identity of students with the involvement of themselves and teachers and stakeholders
- collaborative groups between different schools supported on problem-based learning methodology
- ICT to improve mathematical and linguistic skills of students, including one about students with learning difficulties
- cooperative learning in multicultural groups.

Finally, we could understand that there are some main issues to consider as the most important aspects of these good practices: the motivation of teachers and students about innovative projects; the precise definition of tools and tasks; and the involvement of other educational agents.

CASE	DESCRIPTION
1	There are 3 main tools based on a holistic approach with the focus on the individual and his/ her future opportunities. The 3 main tools are: The risk detector (an electronic tool for counsellors to identify individuals at risk of dropping out), The personal profile (an interview schema for counsellors designated to assist at-risk individuals to examine the learning environment and their weaknesses and strengths), The flexible prevention and support system (prevents young people from dropping out from the school system and supports those that already left)
2	Innovative teachers programme aims to develop teachers' skills with collaborative and project-based learning.

CASE	DESCRIPTION
3	Intel Teach – Advanced Online is a blended learning programme is the teacher training program created by Association Intel Education and Istanbul Provincial Directorate of
	National Education (Istanbul MEM) collaboratively. The learning path design is at the heart of ITAO platform, and this platform brings the teachers from different schools and disciplines to create their common paths. A Learning Path is an online learning resource that teachers can complete at their pace. Using a Learning Path, the teachers can learn about new methodologies while also learning about new technologies and/or new ways of teaching their subject area to promote the 21st skills of learners. ITAO platform contains ideas, resources, planning (lesson planning) and methodology on how to review a lesson. The idea behind it is that someone could access you learning path and then have all the tools that he or she need to be able to deliver the
	lesson (or sequence of lessons) in his or her school/ organisation.
4	The interaction between the students at a distance started with the students' individual introduction of themselves. Primary school students chose to use nicknames in Synergeia2, and junior secondary school students to use their names. They worked on mythology in small groups (2–3 students) and, after a period of brainstorming and discussion, they chose Atlantis from all the myths because it seemed to be the most intriguing and mysterious one. The teachers asked students to search for any information about Atlantis and invited them to search documents and pictures from Internet. Through class discussion, they analysed the information collected and decided what to post in Synergeia2. Each small group uploaded some documents (58 Wles all together both documents and pictures) in Synergeia2, to share them with the other students. In the second work phase of the project, the teachers proposed to divide documents in four different folders: Atlantis in our drawings (students' imaginings of Atlantis and prepared drawings), Contemporary events that send back to Atlantis (students collected hypotheses about Atlantis disappearance), Work hypotheses and interviews on Atlantis (students arranged a questionnaire on Atlantis to propose it to every student at a distance), Evidences and verifications on Atlantis (students gathered information pro and versus Atlantis' existence). Every folder was managed by a small group that organised information and documents. The final goal of the group was to prepare a book (textual or hypertextual), using all the information collected in all folders.
5	Questionnaires were given, they were distinguished between teacher and student. It was mainly focused on learning objectives in the class. For teachers the series of questions asked were: - are Learning objectives easy to write? - who writes them? - what for are Learning objectives? - discuss with whom for what reasons? For the students: - what are learning objectives? - what use are they? - what is the feedback loop? - where do we find them? This was asked as Learning objectives are arguably the best way to communicate to the learner and to third parties on what the Individual truly knows, understands and can do on completion of a learning process. The strategy was the questionnaires and feedback. Thus understand what the students need and know and then formulating the changes needed to be made. It is both student centred and active.
6	Classroom model is based on collaborative teaching and learning. The school actively seeks to enhance interaction and collaboration through the use of ICT: all classrooms are equipped with an interactive whiteboard, wireless internet, and devices for each student (PCs or tablets). Teachers collaborate with their students to create digital learning materials. This mean the students are the facilitators in how they learn, the teachers are there to provide feedback rather than just projecting information onto them. The creation of e-books in which teachers write and produce their books, both in digital and in paper format, which is then made available for students, replacing the traditional publishers' textbooks. To ensure it is up to date and relevant teachers select and produce the content based on the

CASE	DESCRIPTION
	student achievements and needs. There is also the Future Classroom, an interactive learning space that has been established in the school to explore pedagogical approaches with the support of Apple products, such as iBooks Authors, iTunes U, Apple TV, and iPads. The Future Classroom has four separate areas which emphasise on the various aspects of teaching and learning. The first zone is called "Agora" and used for plenaries and presentations; the second zone focuses on digital material production using for example Educreation, iMovies, Keynotes and Pages; the third zone is dedicated to informal learning; and the last one for collaborative learning. The teachers use the room, for example, to organise additional student-led lessons, to develop a more in-depth analysis of some topics and to provide flipped classroom to their students.
7	It is an almost one year project which gathers students, teachers, association, families on the base of volunteering around the concept of identities of the students. They all come with their background, their history. "Toukouleur" valorized the cultures of the minorities which are not so often taken into consideration inside the school (as an institution). Volunteering is foreseen to increase the motivation of all stakeholders. In May nearby the UNESCO day of cultural diversity an event take place. This event has been developed by students for students and includes the educational community (broadly seen)
8	Teachers use a project-based learning methodology (PBL). Students have to explore the real environment to look for information, that will be organised and worked in collaborative groups and presented online using different resources (text, video, audio). There are participating centres from different educational levels. The project has grown, and there are other collaborative projects that have been developed inside the framework of "The ESL times".
9	Subject: Mathematics. Five type of tasks about mathematical concepts, problems and also the election of the logo, pictures and celebrities. Procedures: collaboration on the internet using Moodle, Tuenti and other tools as wiki
10	Subjets: Maths and Language. Collaborative tasks among students from 8 different schools.Tools:Moodle,Blogger,DigitalBook(http://recursostic.educacion.es/descartes/web/indice_edad_esp.php), and some Web 2.0tools. Different tasks in maths and language were proposed by teachers and werecompleted by students in groups with students from differents schools. Telematic tools werethe "common space" to complete the tasks.
11	This methodology is based in the Fenix nests where students with learning difficulties will be integrated into those "nests" (around 8 students) until they are ready to go back to their classroom. It is focused on Portuguese Language and Mathematics, but it is available to other subject identified by a lower success rate. The project is being closely monitored by the Beiriz vertical group of schools , and scientifically followed by the Portuguese Catholic University.
12	Cooperative learning in multicultural groups is quite popular in Flemish primary schools. CUM projects are a didactic tool or set of strategies used for the enhancement of intercultural education. The projects are a means to promote equal participation in interaction and consequently allow equal access to learning. This smalt quantitative and qualitative classroom study addresses some of CLIM's basic assumptions concerning social and academic participation in student interaction. First, we will introduce CUM, its theoretical principles and didactic strategies. The research questions and design are addressed next, followed by the main results of the quantitative analyses. The conclusions of the qualitative analyses of the social and academie participation of the students are presented next. Finally, the role of the teacher is discuseed.

4. FINAL RESULTS

About this topic, we can highlight some ideas like:

- Internationalisation and an award (case 1).
- Good final results in all cases, effective practices and satisfaction of participants
- The majority of them have online evidence that all people can review, resources that all individuals can reuse and also information to replicate the experience
- Success in collaboration involves the activity of students as we have observed in all these good practices. Moreover, over more, the activity of teachers needs to change to be reflective practitioners, counselers,... they have to understand their role based on student centred approach.

CASE	FINAL RESULTS
1	The Stop Dropout is a transfer of innovation project, with great results in Austria, Germany, Czech
	Republic and Slovenia. The PPS Project (www.p-p-s.org), which is the original project, focuses on
	finding at-risk individuals, evaluating their needs and providing them with flexible support. The PPS project received the Best Practice Guidance Award in 2007.
2	This comprehensive program has been implementing by Microsoft Turkey with the Ministry of
	Education (MEB) to increase computer literacy for thousands of teachers. Under the project, more
	than 550,000 teachers have been enrolled in the MEB database.
3	The integration of Learning Paths promotes effective practices and reflective practitioners. It requires
	collaboration across school institutions and subjects, to create a common instructional material, including interdisciplinary lesson plans. Through a Learning Path, teachers can learn about new
	methodologies, new technologies and new ways to promote 21st Century Skills, as they work
	through the 5 steps that make up the module (conceptualization, skills required, application, resource
	requirements and reflection). It is also an ideal opportunity for teachers to role model critical soft
	skills such as collaboration, curiosity, critical thinking. The Learning Path contains ideas, resources,
4	lesson plans and information on methodologies to review a lesson. The database of Italian case study is characterised by many files introduced by students themselves.
4	In all, students introduced 58 documents and 93 notes. There were 11 notes that could not be coded
	in the proposed categories. Four of them were stories about the myths, and thus a new subcategory
	was added for the Content of Inquiry: Telling stories about myths. Seven notes were about asking
	or giving clarifications about technical difficulties with Synergeia, and they were all collected in the
	Other category. Altogether half of the students' notes fall into Social category, suggesting that in the
	Italian culture, creating social relationships among users is the first step to building shared knowledge. Also, this course involved four classes in different schools, and distance communication
	certainly requires social relationships between students who do not know each other.
5	After the hand back of all the information it showed that not all these positive developments are not
	consensus and, therefore, more progress is needed. Although some progress has been made 50%
	of respondents think that progress is slow, the other half are still not convinced that SCL has been
	made a clear priority in higher education. Thus further tailoring to students needs and student centred learning is crucial.
6	According to the teachers, the philosophy of the Majorana School enables them to be facilitators of
	learning; teachers are there is assist and provide guidance and feedback for students' learning. Thus
	the students can learn in a way which best fits them and their needs. Teachers at the school are

CASE	FINAL RESULTS
	continuously reviewing their teaching methods to make learning more effective and stimulating. There is a strong focus on group work, which fosters the interests and abilities of each student, while also reinforcing their collaborative skills. This student centred approach and creating own material are a good example of collaborative work.
7	Evaluations of the project are made by the volunteer teachers who developed the concept. Positive effects on inclusion, motivation, cross-sector learning, teamwork,
8	Work is published online in http://theesltimes.blogspot.com.es Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/groups/theesltimes#_=_ Twitter: https://twitter.com/TheESLTimes YouTube: https://www.youtube.com/user/TheESLTimes
9	Reports of students, meetings to share experiences, public resources published on the net
10	Evidence and results: http://desarrollocolaborativodecompetencias.blogspot.com.es/p/difusion.html
11	In 6th grade (part of the ISCED 1 cycle and age group with 12 years old), the results are higher than the national average marks in the Portuguese exam by the Fenix project by 1.4 points (on a scale of 0-100, Fenix students had an average mark around 57.8, and the national average mark is 56,4). Regarding Math, there isn't a difference between the students from nests and those from regular classrooms. Nevertheless, in ISCED 2 education level the average results are rather lower within the nests than the average marks from other students at both subjects (Portuguese: Fenix 39.5 against 50.1 at a national level, Math: Fenix had 30 points against the 39.3 points at a national realm).
12	Evidenceandresults:http://cteno.be/downloads/publicaties/van_den_branden_van_gorp_2003_cooperative_learning.pdf

5. WHY ARE THEY RELEVANT?

The discussion about this issue brings us to this point:

- The development of new models and innovative methodologies to work in class.
- Tools to develop these methods and to implement these models.
- Need to develop digital skills in some cases, both teachers and students.
- Context and student's needs are key factors to design and implement the collaboration.
- Positive effects on motivation, leadership and relations between schools, not only teachers and students.

CASE	RELEVANCE REASONS
1	It is a practice that helps to identify students who are most at risk at an early stage, it developed a practical interviewing model for teachers and counsellors, it provides ways to increase the effectiveness of the counselling, and it provides a tool which has been successfully implemented in several countries
2	No answer
3	There are two areas of great significance listed in the ET 2020 framework: Opening up Education and Professionalisation of Teachers and School Leaders. According to the principle of Opening up Education, acquiring digital skills is a major step for teachers towards the efficient use of the vast potential created by digital technologies. The development of digital skills is seen as a necessary investment in our teachers, an investment that will deliver real benefits for pupils, students, and the

	 future of Europe. It provides an opportunity to increase quality, efficiency and equity in education. ITAO focuses on innovative teaching practices and learning styles to improve the learning experience encourages collaboration among teachers, pupils and institutions and uses a platform as a virtual learning and collaboration environment, an area where to share ideas, expertise, learning objects
4	This collaboration of distant classes can be very motivating, but it also creates logistic problems that can be disheartening if the communication does not work smoothly.
5	It shows the collaborative needs met through both analysing the students needs while also questioning teachers. Its based on students needs. Which is crucial for collaborating learning.
6	Its focused on the achievements and areas that the students want and need. It is more focused on their needs and teachers are there to support rather than broadcasting information. The creation of e-books is an example of the collaboration between the teacher and students. Also with the school also communicating with 100 other schools all over Italy it shows it is representative and can be used in Italy and represents what the students want to learn.
7	Positive effects on leadership. Positive impact on students (motivation) while working core learning. Good example of a long term project based on collaborative learning
8	To promote collaborative work, not only among secondary students but other classes and levels Any teacher that would like to collaborate can do it (using ICT) ICT are used as a channel to share and expand the experience Students develop different English skills and work collaboratively to create resources Students have to look for cultural and historical aspects of their environment (significative learning).
9	It is a good example of collaboration among students (collaborative groups) and among teachers (social net) and it is an example of collaboration among secondary schools in different locations in Spain. Also, it is really interesting because it has been organized during one academic year. Finally, the subject is mathematics, one of the most problematic subjects on Secondary school.
10	This practice is relevant because involves a huge number of students and more than one schools (8). Also is important because it involves instrumental areas (maths and language) and transversal areas (ICT).
11	This practice was chosen since it started as a local practice at Beiriz vertical group of schools in coordination with the Portuguese Catholic University that later render in a specific policy implementation at a national level. The Plus School Success Programme (PMSE, 2009) has born from this practice (http://www.dge.mec.pt/sites/default/files/EPIPSE/edital_regulamento_mais_sucesso_escolar2.pdf). Other similar practices appeared since then and therefore, increasing the positive impact on the overall education results and teaching environment.
12	It stimulates collaboration taking different personalities and capabilities of students into account. Every participant is given responsibility for the work after acquired the necessary skills and knowledge in group
	I





Collected Cases

CASE 1

ITLE	MAIN GOALS	
Stop Dropout	to reduce the ESL rate in the school system and adult education	
URL		
http://www.stop-dropout.eu/index.php?id=4&L=1		
51	op Dropout	

DESCRIPTION

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	teachers and trainers, counselors
DESCRIPTION	There are 3 main tools based on a holistic approach with the focus on the individual and his/ her future opportunities. The 3 main tools are: The risk detector (an electronic tool for counsellors to identify individuals at risk of dropping out), The personal profile (an interview schema for counsellors designated to assist at-risk individuals to examine the learning environment and their weaknesses and strengths), The flexible prevention and support system (prevents young people from dropping out from the school system and supports those that already dropped out)
FINAL RESULTS	The Stop Dropout is a transfer of innovation project, with great results in Austria, Germany, Czech Republic and Slovenia. The PPS Project (www.p-p-s.org), which is the original project, focuses on finding at-risk individuals, evaluating their needs and providing them with flexible support. The PPS project received the Best Practice Guidance Award in 2007.
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	It is a practice that helps to identify students who are mostly at risk at an early stage, it developed a practical interviewing model for teachers and counsellors, it provides ways to increase the effectiveness of the counselling and it provides a tool which has been successfully implemented in several countries

CASE 2

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS
ASIST OGRETIM KURUMLARI	Innovative teachers programme	Develop teachers' skills with collaborative learning
URL		
http://yenilikciogretmenler.meb.gov.tr/		

DESCRIPTION

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	Ministry of Education (MEB) teachers
DESCRIPTION	Innovative teachers programme aims to develop teachers' skills with collaborative and project-based learning.
FINAL RESULTS	This comprehensive program has been implementing by Microsoft Turkey with the Ministry of Education (MEB) to increase computer literacy for thousands of teachers. Under the project, more than 550,000 teachers have been enrolled in the MEB database.
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	There are two areas of major importance listed in the ET 2020 framework: Opening up Education and Professionalization of Teachers and School Leaders. According to the principle of Opening up Education, acquiring digital skills is an important step for teachers towards the efficient use of the vast potential created by digital technologies. The development of digital skills is seen as a necessary investment in our teachers, an investment that will deliver real benefits for pupils, students, and the future of Europe. It provides an opportunity to increase quality, efficiency and equity in education.

CASE 3

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS
ASIST	ITAO- Intel Teach –	It focuses on innovative teaching practices and learning styles to improve the learning experience,
OGRETIM	Advanced Online	encourages collaboration among teachers, pupils and institutions, uses a platform as a virtual learning and
KURUMLARI	Programme	collaboration environment, an area where to share ideas, expertise, learning objects, requires teachers to
		integrate learning paths into their lesson plans, and then to reflect and self-evaluate methods and suggest
		improvements and promotes effective practices and reflective practitioners
URL		
http://www.itao-es.com/		

DESCRIPTION

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	Intel Teach – Advanced Online platform is a virtual learning area that nurtures the work of teachers and supports their collective engagement. It is also used to share ideas, expertise, and digital learning resources. The core concept of the programme is the Learning Path, an iterative process integrating lesson plans and project-based approaches, created and continuously improved by peers. Teachers are asked to integrate learning paths into their teaching, and then to reflect
	and self-evaluate methods and suggest improvements. Teachers' views of themselves as capable of generating knowledge about children and learning and the practice of teaching enhance their identity as professionals.
DESCRIPTION	Intel Teach – Advanced Online is a blended learning programme is the teacher training program created by Association Intel Education and Istanbul Provincial Directorate for National Education (Istanbul MEM) collaboratively.
	The learning path design is at the heart of ITAO platform, and this platform brings the teachers from different schools and disciplines to create their common paths. A Learning Path is an online learning resource that teachers can complete at their pace. Using a Learning Path, the teachers can learn about new methodologies while also learning about new technologies and/or new ways of teaching their subject area to promote the 21st skills of learners. ITAO platform contains ideas, resources, planning (lesson planning) and methodology on how to review a lesson. The idea behind it is that someone could access you learning path and then have all the tools that he or she need to be able to deliver the lesson (or sequence of lessons) in their school / organisation.
FINAL RESULTS	The integration of Learning Paths promotes effective practices and reflective practitioners. It requires collaboration across school institutions and subjects, to create a common instructional material, including interdisciplinary lesson plans. Through a Learning Path, teachers can learn about new methodologies, new technologies and new ways to promote 21st Century Skills, as they work through the 5 steps that make up the module (conceptualization, skills required, application,

	resource requirements and reflection). It is also an ideal opportunity for teachers to role model critical soft skills such as collaboration, curiosity, critical thinking. The Learning Path contains ideas, resources, lesson plans and information on methodologies to review a lesson.				
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	There are two areas of major importance listed in the ET 2020 framework: Opening up Education and Professionalisation of Teachers and School Leaders. According to the principle of Opening up Education, acquiring digital skills is an important step for teachers towards the efficient use of the vast potential created by digital technologies. The development of digital skills is seen as a necessary investment in our teachers, an investment that will deliver real benefits for pupils, students, and the future of Europe. It provides an opportunity to increase quality, efficiency and equity in education. ITAO focuses on innovative teaching practices and learning styles to improve the learning experience encourages collaboration among teachers, pupils and institutions and uses a platform as a virtual learning and collaboration environment, an area where to share ideas, expertise, learning objects				
PARTNER	PARTNER TITLE		MAIN GOALS		
--	--------------------	---	--	--	--
CESIE	European mythology		To promote the distance classroom collaboration		
URL	URL				
DESCRIPTIO	N				
CONTEXT PARTICIPA	AND		lved in this project were two 4th grade and one 5th grade classes from a primary school in Rome; and ass from a junior secondary school in Milan (aged 9–11). Six teachers (two with experience of CLE, and		
FARTIGIFA	110	four with no expe	brience) supported the students in the collaborative work within Synergeia2. The project lasted 20 weeks, h per week, both in the classroom and in the computer lab.		
DESCRIPTIO	N	school students of worked on mytho Atlantis from all th to search for any class discussion uploaded some of other students. I folders: Atlantis in back to Atlantis Atlantis (students verifications on A a small group that	etween the students at a distance started with the students' individual introduction of themselves. Primary chose to use nicknames in Synergeia2, and junior secondary school students to use their names. They ology in small groups (2–3 students) and, after a period of brainstorming and discussion, they chose he myths because it seemed to be the most intriguing and mysterious one. The teachers asked students a information about Atlantis and invited them to search documents and pictures from Internet. Through they analysed the information collected and decided what to post in Synergeia2. Each small group documents (58 Wles all together both documents and pictures) in Synergeia2, to share them with the n the second work phase of the project, the teachers proposed to divide documents in four different nour drawings (students' imaginings of Atlantis and prepared drawings), Contemporary events that send (students collected hypotheses about Atlantis disappearance), Work hypotheses and interviews on s arranged a questionnaire on Atlantis to propose it to every student at a distance), Evidences and ttantis (students gathered information pro and versus Atlantis' existence). Every folder was managed by at organised information and documents. The final goal of the group was to prepare a book (textual or sing all the information collected in all folders.		
introduced 58 do of them were sto about myths. Sev were all collected		introduced 58 do of them were sto about myths. Sev were all collected	Italian case study is characterised by many files introduced by students themselves. In all, students becoments and 93 notes. There were 11 notes that could not be coded in the proposed categories. Four ries about the myths, and thus a new subcategory was added for the Content of Inquiry: Telling stories were notes were about asking or giving clarifications about technical difficulties with Synergeia, and they d in the Other category. Altogether half of the students' notes fall into Social category, suggesting that in e, creating social relationships among users is the first step to building shared knowledge. Also, this		

	course involved four classes in different schools, and distance communication certainly requires social relationships between students who do not know each other.
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	This collaboration of distant classes can be very motivating, but it also creates logistic problems that can be disheartening if the communication does not work smoothly.

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS	
	Consolidating Higher Education Experience of Reform: norms, networks and good practice in Italy (CHEER)		
URL http://www.processodibologna.it/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/TIM-BIRTWISTLE_Pisa-December-2015.pdf			

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	University students and faculty members. Universities: • University of Tor Vergata • National Dance Academy • University of Roma Tre • University of Bologna • University of Pisa	
DESCRIPTION	Questionnaires were given, they were distinguished between teacher and student. It was mainly focused on learning objectives in the class. For teachers the series of questions asked were: - are Learning objectives easy to write? - who writes them? - what are Learning objectives for? - discuss with whom for what reasons? For the students: - what are learning objectives? - what use are they? - what is the feedback loop? - where do we find them? This was asked as Learning objectives are arguably the best way to communicate to the learner and to third parties on what the Individual truly knows, understands and can do on completion of a learning process. The strategy was the questionnaires and feedback. Thus understand what the students need and know and then formulating the changes needed to be made. It is both student centred and active.	
FINAL RESULTS	After the hand back of all the information it showed that not all these positive developments are not consensus and, therefore, more progress is needed. Although some progress has been made 50% of respondents think that progress is slow, the other half are still not convinced that SCL has been made a clear priority in higher education. Thus further tailoring to students needs and student centred learning is crucial.	
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	It shows the collaborative needs met through both analysing the students needs while also questioning teachers. It is based on students needs. Which is crucial for collaborating learning.	

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS
CESIE	ITIS Majorana School	ITIS Majorana School's classroom model is based on collaborative teaching and learning. The school actively seeks to enhance interaction and collaboration through the use of ICT: all classrooms are equipped with an interactive whiteboard, wireless internet, and devices for each student (PCs or tablets). Teachers collaborate with their students to create digital learning materials.
URL		
http://lsl.eun.	org/majorana	

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	110 teacher and 1200 students (secondary school) Creation of e-books involve over 100 schools from across Italy
DESCRIPTION	Classroom model is based on collaborative teaching and learning. The school actively seeks to enhance interaction and collaboration through the use of ICT: all classrooms are equipped with an interactive whiteboard, wireless internet, and devices for each student (PCs or tablets). Teachers collaborate with their students to create digital learning materials. This mean the students are the facilitators in how they learn, the teachers are there to provide feedback rather than just projecting information onto them. The creation of e-books in which teachers write and produce their books, both in digital and in paper format, which is then made available for students, replacing the traditional publishers' textbooks. To ensure it is up to date and relevant teachers select and produce the content based on the student achievements and needs. There is also the Future Classroom, an interactive learning space that has been established in the school to explore pedagogical approaches with the support of Apple products, such as iBooks Authors, iTunes U, Apple TV, and iPads. The Future Classroom has four distinguished areas which emphasise on the various aspects of teaching and learning. The first zone is called "agora" and used for plenaries and presentations; the second zone focuses on digital material production using for example Educreation, iMovies, Keynotes and Pages; the third zone is dedicated to informal learning; and the last one for collaborative learning. The teachers use the room, for example, to organise additional student-led lessons, to develop a more in-depth analysis of some topics and to provide flipped classroom to their students.
FINAL RESULTS	According to the teachers, the philosophy of the Majorana School enables them to be facilitators of learning; teachers are there is assist and provide guidance and feedback for students' learning. Thus the students can learn in a way which best fits them and their needs. Teachers at the school are continuously reviewing their teaching methods to make learning more effective and stimulating. There is a strong focus on group work, which fosters the interests and abilities of each

	student, while also reinforcing their collaborative skills. This student centred approach and creating own material are a good example of collaborative work.
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	Its focused on the achievements and areas that the students want and need. It is more focused on their needs and teachers are there to support rather than broadcasting information. The creation of e-books is an example of the collaboration between the teacher and students. Also with the school also communicating with 100 other schools all over Italy it shows it is representative and can be used in Italy and represents what the students want to learn.

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS	
PISTES SOLIDAIRES	TOUKOULEUR	Involvement of the educational community (teacher, parents, ngo, student)	
URL			
http://www.ac-nice.fr/breguieres/index.php?tab=presentation			

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	112 students aged between 13 & 14 years old. Collège Les Bréguières, 06800 CAGNES-SUR-MER
DESCRIPTION	It is an almost one year project which gathers students, teachers, association, families on the base of volunteering around the concept of identities of the students. They all come with their own background, their history. "Toukouleur" valorized the cultures of the minorities which are not so often taken into consideration inside the school (as an institution). Volunteering is foreseen to increase the motivation of all stakeholders. In May nearby the UNESCO day of cultural diversity an event take place. This event has been developed by students for students and includes the educational community (broadly seen)
FINAL RESULTS	Evaluations of the project are made by the volunteer teachers who developed the concept. Positive effect on inclusion, motivation, cross-sector learning, teamwork,
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	Positif effects on leadership. Positive impact on students (motivation) while working core learning. Good example of a long term project based on collaborative learning

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS		
UNIVERSITY OF MURCIA	The ESL learning	Students work as journalist publishing information about their school or city working collaboratively and using ICT to publish and share the information Working with the four language skills: reading, listening, speaking and writing Encouraging reading in English Using ICT when teaching/learning English Promoting collaborative work, teamwork, independent work Valuing the sociocultural side of the English language.		
URL	URL			
http://theesltimes.blogspot.com.es				

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	Secondary students (open to other levels). There are participating 12 centres.		
DESCRIPTION	Teachers use a project-based learning methodology (PBL). Students have to explore the real environment to look for information, that will be organised and worked in collaborative groups and presented online using different resources (text, video, audio). There are participating centres from different educational levels. The project has grown, and there are other collaborative projects that have been developed inside the framework of "The ESL times".		
FINAL RESULTS	Workispublishedonlineinhttp://theesItimes.blogspot.com.esFacebook:https://www.facebook.com/groups/theesItimes#_=_Twitter:https://twitter.com/TheESLTimesFacebook:https://www.youtube.com/user/TheESLTimesTwitter:https://twitter.com/TheESLTimesYouTube:		
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	To promote collaborative work, not only among secondary students but other classes and levels Any teacher that would like to collaborate can do it (using ICT) ICT are used as a channel to share and expand the experience Students develop different English skills and work collaboratively to create resources Students have to look for cultural and historical aspects of their environment (significative learning).		

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS			
UNIVERSITY OF MURCIA	Con Mirada matemática	To promote mathematical competence with a collaborative experience among students and also the collaboration among teachers (double level of collaboration). Another goals are: promote the motivation about mathematics; promote the use of ICT (digital competence).			
URL	URL				
http://conmiradamatematica.wikispaces.com					

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	First level: 120 students from 5 Spanish secondary schools. Second level: all their teachers
DESCRIPTION	Subject: Mathematics. Five type of tasks about mathematical concepts, problems and also the election of the logo, pictures and celebrities. Procedures: collaboration on the internet using Moodle, Tuenti and other tools as a wiki.
FINAL RESULTS	Reports of students, meetings to share experiences, public resources published on the net.
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	It is a good example of collaboration among students (collaborative groups) and among teachers (social net) and it is an example of collaboration among secondary schools in different locations in Spain. Also, it is really interesting because it has been organized during one academic year. Finally, the subject is mathematics, one of the most problematic subjects on Secondary school.

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS			
UNIVERSITY OF MURCIA	Collaborative Develop of Competences	To develop basic competencies in Secondary Education students in the frame of the programme "Escuela TIC 2.0" in the areas of Maths and Language.			
URL					
http://desarrollo	colaborativodecompeter	ncias.blogspot.com.es			

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	First year of Secondary Education. 12-13 years old students. More than 200 students from 8 different Secondary School were involved.
DESCRIPTION	Subjets: Maths and Language. Collaborative tasks among students from 8 different schools. Tools: Moodle, Blogger, Digital Book (http://recursostic.educacion.es/descartes/web/indice_edad_esp.php), and some Web 2.0 tools. Different tasks in maths and language were proposed by teachers and were completed by students in groups with students from differents schools. Telematic tools were the "common space" to complete the tasks.
FINAL RESULTS	Evidence and results: http://desarrollocolaborativodecompetencias.blogspot.com.es/p/difusion.html
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	This practice is relevant because involves a huge number of students and more than one schools (8). Also is important because it involves instrumental areas (maths and language) and transversal areas (ICT).

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS
INOVAMAIS	Fenix Methodology	Framed by Dispatch No. 100/2010 of January 5th, this program aims to improve educational results and prevention of dropout in ISCED 1 and 2, based on organisational models that allow a more customised support among students with learning difficulties. It emerged with the purpose to improve students' learning environment and adapt to their learning needs avoiding early school leaving and unsuccessful pathways. For the Programme was also created a monitoring commission, which includes several entities engaged in the implementation process of these organisational models.
URL		
http://www.dg	e.mec.pt/fenix	

CONTEXT AND	The Programme officially started in 2009/2010 with 46 organic units across the country and decreasing slightly for 38 units in
PARTICIPANTS	2012/2013. These units watched for 5 156 students in 2009/2010, which has dropped for 4 620 in 2010/2011, 4 400 in 2011/2012
	and 3 693 in 2012/2013. The students groups ranged from 9 years to 16 years old. The number of classes had not a linear
	behaviour, starting with 247 classrooms in 2009/2010, dropping to 207 in the following year, rising again in 2011/2012 for 231
	classrooms and then diminishing for 207 classrooms engaged within the project in 2012/2013. To what concerns the teachers,
	there were 727 teachers involved in the first edition of the Fenix Methodology with a linear descendent behaviour until 2012/2013
	in which only 413 teachers have participated.
DESCRIPTION	This methodology is based in the Fenix nests where students with learning difficulties will be integrated into those "nests" (around
	8 students) until they are ready to go back to their classroom. It is focused on Portuguese Language and Mathematics, but it is
	available to other subject identified by a lower success rate. The project is being closely monitored by the Beiriz vertical group of
	schools, and scientifically followed by the Portuguese Catholic University.
FINAL RESULTS	In 6th grade (part of the ISCED 1 cycle and age group with 12 years old), the results are higher than the national average marks
TINAL RESOLTS	in the Portuguese exam by the Fenix project by 1.4 points (on a scale of 0-100, Fenix students had an average mark around
	57.8, and the national average mark is 56,4). Regarding Math, there isn't a difference between the students from nests and those
	from regular classrooms. Nevertheless, in ISCED 2 education level the average results are rather lower within the nests than the
	average marks from other students at both subjects (Portuguese: Fenix 39.5 against 50.1 at a national level, Math: Fenix had 30
	points against the 39.3 points at a national realm).

WHY	IS	IT	This practice wa	as chosen since it stai	rted as a local prac	tice at Beiriz vertica	I group of schools in	coordination v	vith the P	ortuguese
RELEV	ANT?		Catholic University	sity that later render in	n a specific policy	implementation at a	national level. The l	Plus School Si	uccess P	rogramme
			(PMSE,	2009)	has	born	from	this		practice
			(http://www.dge	.mec.pt/sites/default/	files/EPIPSE/edita	I_regulamento_mai	s_sucesso_escolar2	.pdf). Other	similar	practices
			appeared since	then and therefore, in	ncreasing the posi	tive impact on the o	verall education resu	ults and teaching	ing enviro	onment.

PARTNER	TITLE	MAIN GOALS
Univ. College	Cooperative	Cooperative learning in multicultural groups is quite popular in Flemish primary schools. CUM projects are a
Leuven	learning in	didactic tool or set of strategies used for the enhancement of intercultural education. The projects are a means to
(Belgium)	multicultural	promote equal participation in interaction and consequently allow equal access to learning. This smalt quantitative
	groups	and qualitative classroom study addresses some of CLIM's basic assumptions concerning social and academic
		participation in student interaction. First, we will introduce CUM, its theoretical principles and didactic strategies.
		The research questions and design are addressed next, followed by the main results of the quantitative analyses.
		The conclusions of the qualitative analyses of the social and academie participation of the students are presented
		next. Finally, the role of the teacher is discuseed.

URL

http://cteno.be/downloads/publicaties/van_den_branden_van_gorp_2003_cooperative_learning.pdf

CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS	6 to 16 years old students.
DESCRIPTION	"Co-operative Learning In Multicultural groups" (CLIM) is quite popular in Flemish primary schools. CUM projects are a didactic tool or set of strategies used for the enhancement of intercultural education. The projects are a means to promote equal participation in interaction and consequently allow equal access to learning. This smalt quantitative and qualitative classroom study addresses some of CLIM's basic assumptions concerning social and academic participation in student interaction. First, we will introduce CUM, its theoretical principles and didactic strategies. The research questions and design are addressed next, followed by the main results of the quantitative analyses. The conclusions of the qualitative analyses of the social and academic participation of the students are presented next. Finally, the role of the teacher is discussed.
FINAL RESULTS	Publications.
	Training for teachers and schools.
WHY IS IT RELEVANT?	 It stimulates collaboration taking different personalities and capabilities of students into account. Every participant is given responsibility for the work after acquired the necessary skills and knowledge in group





Desk Research Conclusions

The desk research developed has shown us information about statistics and policies regards ESL, existing national frameworks for the assessment of teacher competences, benchmarks used and applied standards and finally an interesting collection of good practices in collaborative learning.

As we have explained in this report, a significant group of projects to mitigate the ESL has been developed in these last years (2010-2014) within the seven partnership countries. These projects demonstrate that the ESL is an important issue for different governments who implement national actions and offer some general policy guidelines. Not only governments are aware of ESL, also there are different local institutions, organisations and associations that work to prevent young people from being early school leavers. These local institutions focus on different target groups and are centred in specific actions (job promotion, girls, families).

Despite of the fact that the situation in Europe has improved in the last years and the fact of there are national and local projects to mitigate ESL, an important amount of young people (aged 18-24) still being early school leavers, as we have found. For this reason, we think that it is clear the relevance of developing and implementing projects like CARMA in which ESL is addressed inside the school where the ESL problems start. CARMA offers non-formal approaches to education to increase student motivation and participation. Moreover, there are interesting initiatives that we have collected in this desk research as best practices found in the partnership countries, regarding ESL, avoiding and prevention. These practices demonstrate us that collaborative learning and nonformal techniques are and interested and needed way to avoid ESL.

On the other hand, the desk research has been useful to analyse mechanisms used by the governments to evaluate secondary school teachers' competencies. We couldn't find a national Framework to evaluate teachers' competencies in all 7 countries of the partnership. Still, a certain Framework for assessing teachers' competencies already exists in each of them but none of them centred on collaborative work. In this sense one of the main goals in CARMA is to increase and improve the competences of teachers through providing a training and assessment framework with the necessary skills, knowledge and resources on how to use inclusive and participatory practices in their own teaching and develop collaborative relationships in and out of the classroom.

References

- Consejo Escolar del Estado (2015): "Informe 2015 sobre el estado del sistema educativo. CURSO 2013– 2014". Gobierno de España. Ministerio De Educación, Cultura Y Deporte
- Consejo escolar del Estado, Ministerio de Educación, Cultura y Deporte (2015): "Informe 2015 sobre el estado del sistema educativo. CURSO 2013– 2014".
- Conze (2011), Comprehensive policies to reduce early school leaving, Seminarie Vroegtijdig schoolverlaten, 31 mei 2011, Brussel.
- Creten, van de Velde, Van Damme & Verhaest (2004). De transitie van het initieel beroepsonderwijs naar de arbeidsmarkt met specifieke aandacht voor de onderwijsverlaters
- Directorate-General for Education (http://dge.mec.pt/)
- European Commission (2012) (Directorate-General of Education and Culture), Education and Training Monitor 2012, Publications Office of the European Union, Luxembourg.
- Eurostat (2014). Europe 2020 indicators education. Retrieved from: http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statisticsexplained/index.php/Europe_2020_indicators_-_education
- Eurostat (2015). Early leavers from education and training. Retrieved from: http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statisticsexplained/index.php/Early_leavers_from_education_and_training
- Eurostat (2016). Early leavers from education and training by sex: % of the population aged 18-24 with at most lower secondary education and not in further education or training [Data file]. Retrieved from: http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/tgm/table.do?tab=table&init=1&language=en&pcode =t2020_40&plugin=1
- Eurostat (2016). Early leavers from education and training by sex and labour status. [Data file]. Retrieved from: http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/show.do?dataset=edat_lfse_14&lang=en.
- Eurostat (2016). Early leavers from education and training by sex and degree of urbanisation. [Data file]. Retrieved from: http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/show.do?dataset=edat_lfse_30&lang=en
- International Organization for Migration, Foreign-born Children in Europe (2009) An Overview from the Health Behaviour in School-Aged Children (HBSC) Study.
- Italian law (2015) "Piano triennale dell"offerta formativa, azioni e ruoli del dirigente scolastico e degli organi collegiali". Law 107 of 2015

Italian law (2015) "Riforma del sistema nazionale di istruzione e formazione".

National Statistics Institute (INE) www.ine.pt

PORDATA: www.pordata.pt

STANDARD Verlagsgesellschaft M.B.H. (2016). EU-Bildungsanzeiger 2015: Lob und Tadel für Österreich. Retrieved from: http://derstandard.at/2000025596166/EU-Bildungsanzeiger-2015-Lob-und-Tadel-fuer-Oesterreich

CARMA Consortium













Project Coordinator – Italy www.cesie.org | rosina.ndukwe[a]cesie.org

Spain www.um.es/gite | pazprend[a]um.es

France www.pistes-solidaires.fr | mathieu[a]pistes-solidaires.fr

Turkey www.dogaokullari.com | sedef.altas[a]dogakoleji.com

Belgium www.ucll.be | karine.hindrix[a]ucll.be

Portugal www.inovamais.eu | ana.leal[a]inovamais.pt

Austria www.migration.cc | c.mezinca[a]migration.cc

CARMA

Non-formal learning for student motivation